



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 11, 2020

Mr. Trey Qualls
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
200 Texas Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102-6311

OR2020-07640

Dear Mr. Qualls:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 816341 (ORR# W095126).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for three specified incident reports. The city states it has released some of the requested information, but claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

[T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working

papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). The city asserts the submitted information is confidential under section 261.201. However, we find the city has not established this information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code or consists of a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of section 261.201). Therefore, the submitted information is not confidential under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). The city states incident report number 190090370 relates to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the city may generally withhold incident report number 190090370 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

However, the requestor is a representative of the Fort Worth Housing Solutions, which is a local housing authority (the “housing authority”). The Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) is required to provide criminal history record information (“CHRI”) to a noncriminal justice agency that is authorized to receive CHRI pursuant to a federal statute, executive order or state statute. *See id.* § 411.083(b)(2). In Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997), this office concluded a local housing authority is a noncriminal justice agency authorized by federal statute to receive CHRI. *See* ORD 655 at 4. The federal Housing Opportunity Program Extension Act of 1996 authorizes housing authorities to obtain criminal records of applicants and tenants. Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) of title 42 of the United States Code provides “the National Crime Information Center, police departments, and other law enforcement agencies shall, upon request, provide information to public housing agencies regarding the criminal conviction records of adult applicants for, or tenants of, public housing for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction.” 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code, an agency

that is entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS is also authorized to “obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that [agency].” Gov’t Code § 411.087(a)(2). Thus, a housing authority is also authorized to obtain CHRI from a local criminal justice agency such as the city. See ORD 655 at 4; see also Gov’t Code §§ 411.083(b)(2), .087(a). CHRI consists of “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2).

Federal law limits the purposes for which a public housing authority may request CHRI. Federal law provides that (1) public housing agencies may receive CHRI for adult applicants for public housing or for adult tenants of public housing, and (2) CHRI may only be used for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction. 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) states a housing authority shall be provided access to the CHRI “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law.” *Id.* Based on this language, we conclude section 1437d(q)(1)(A) prevails over section 552.108 of the Government Code. Cf. *Equal Employment Opportunity Comm’n v. City of Orange, Texas*, 905 F. Supp. 381, 382 (E.D. Tex. 1995) (federal law prevails over inconsistent provision of state law).

The requestor asserts the requested information will be used purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction. Accordingly, the city must release any CHRI of an applicant or tenant of public housing that is contained within the submitted information in accordance with section 1437d(q)(1) of chapter 42 of the United States Code. With the exception of basic information, which the city must also release, the city may withhold the remaining information in incident report number 190090370 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. See *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we agree the information that the city has marked under common-law privacy satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information it has marked and the submitted dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal

identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.¹ See Gov't Code § 552.130. The city must withhold the submitted driver's license numbers and issuing state under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must release any CHRI of an applicant or tenant of public housing that is contained within the submitted information in accordance with section 1437d(q)(1) of chapter 42 of the United States Code. With the exception of basic information, which the city must release, the city may withhold the remaining information in incident report number 190090370 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the information it has marked and the submitted dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must also withhold the submitted driver's license numbers and issuing state under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,


James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/jxd

Ref: ID# 816341

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).