



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 10, 2020

Ms. Dyanne Hargrove
Paralegal
City of Cedar Park
450 Cypress Road
Cedar Park, Texas 78613

OR2020-07457

Dear Ms. Hargrove:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 815649 (Ref. No. 20-343).

The Cedar Park Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to service calls involving a specified address during a certain time period. You state the department will withhold social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You also state the department will release some information to the requestor. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); Open Records Decision No. 434 (1986). You state Exhibit C pertains to criminal investigations that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Based on this representation, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue.

¹ Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Accordingly, the department may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state Exhibits D and E relate to pending criminal investigations and prosecutions, and release of the information would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of the cases. Based upon this representation and our review of the information at issue, we conclude the release of the information in Exhibit E would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to Exhibit E. Accordingly, the department may withhold Exhibit E under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

However, we note Exhibit D pertains to an investigation of a Class C misdemeanor. The statute of limitations for a Class C misdemeanor is two years from the date of the offense. *See Code Crim. Proc. art. 12.02*. More than two years have elapsed since the underlying incident for the alleged offense occurred. You do not inform us any criminal charges were filed within the applicable limitations period. Accordingly, we find you have failed to demonstrate the release of Exhibit D would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1)*. Therefore, the department may not withhold Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See Open Records Decision No. 455* (1987). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we conclude some of the remaining information meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the

information you marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You state the department will redact information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.² Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department may withhold Exhibit E under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kieran Hillis
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KH/jxd

² Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

Ms. Dyanne Hargrove - Page 4

Ref: ID# 815649

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)