



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 6, 2020

Ms. LaNetra Lary
Assistant County Attorney
Fort Bend County
401 Jackson Street, 3rd Floor
Richmond, Texas 77469

OR2020-07254

Dear Ms. Lary:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 815083.

The Fort Bend County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for specified reports pertaining to a named facility. You state the sheriff's office will release report numbers 15-36035, 16-22337, 16-27940, 16-38386, 18-47593, and 19-32441. You claim the remaining submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, the following:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

¹ We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see also id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Upon review, we find some of the submitted information involves juvenile offenders, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.008 apply. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.² However, we find none of the remaining information at issue involves a juvenile suspect, offender, or defendant engaging in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision for the purposes of section 58.008(b). Thus, the sheriff’s office may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Id. § 261.201(a). We agree some of the remaining information relates to investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the sheriff's office. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of section 261.201 as a person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). As you do not indicate the sheriff's office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.³ *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the reports you indicated in the remaining information pertain to active criminal investigations or prosecutions. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the reports you indicated in the remaining information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You claim section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information you indicated because the information pertains to closed cases that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. However, you also inform us report numbers 16-24861, 16-7307, and 18-4418 resulted in convictions of the defendants. Therefore, with the exception of report numbers 16-24861, 16-7307, and 18-4418, we find section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information you indicated in the remaining information. However, we find section 552.108(a)(2) is not applicable to report numbers 16-24861, 16-7307, and 18-4418, and the sheriff's office may not withhold them on this basis.

³ As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your remaining arguments against its disclosure.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes a detailed description of the offense and the identity of the complainant, but does not include the identity of the victim, unless the victim is the complainant. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. In addition, basic information does not include dates of birth or motor vehicle record information encompassed by section 552.130 of the Government Code. *See id.* Thus, with the exception of report numbers 16-24861, 16-7307, and 18-4418 and basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the information you indicated in the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.⁴

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in part:

(a) A communication between certified emergency medical services personnel or a physician providing medical supervision and a patient that is made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patient is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(a)-(b). The remaining information does not consist of communications between certified emergency medical services personnel providing medical supervision and patients that were made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patients. *See id.* § 773.091(a). Furthermore, the information at issue does not consist of records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of patients by emergency medical services personnel providing medical supervision that were created by the emergency medical services personnel or maintained by an emergency medical services provider. *See id.* § 773.091(b). Accordingly, we find section 773.091 does not apply to any portion of the remaining information, and the sheriff's office may not withhold any of it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685

⁴ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

(Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied). (mem. op.). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. However, we note some of the information at issue pertains to individuals who will be de-identified and whose privacy interests will, thus, be protected. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked and indicated, and the dates of birth of identified public citizens, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.⁵ However, we find the remaining information either pertains to de-identified individuals or is not highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold driver's license numbers and states of issuance and the additional information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.136 of the Government Code.⁶ Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold routing numbers, bank account numbers, and the additional information we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses at issue are not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the personal e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the

⁵ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

⁶ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure the social security number of a living person. *Id.* § 552.147(a). Upon review, we find the sheriff's office may withhold social security numbers in the remaining information under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. With the exception of report numbers 16-24861, 16-7307, and 18-4418 and basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the information you indicated in the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold (1) the information we marked and indicated and the dates of birth of identified public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (2) driver's license numbers and states of issuance and the additional information we marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (3) routing numbers, bank account numbers, and the additional information we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office may withhold social security numbers in the remaining information under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the personal e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Michelle Garza
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MRG/be

Ms. LaNetra Lary - Page 7

Ref: ID# 815083

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)