



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 19, 2020

Ms. P. Armstrong
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar, 6th Floor. 6W
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2020-05152

Dear Ms. Armstrong:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 812336 (ORR Nos. D034294-112019 and D033544-111319).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received two requests from different requestors for certain information pertaining to a specified incident, including certain information regarding four named department police officers.¹ The department indicates it released some information to the requestors. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection,

¹ We note the department sought and received clarification from the second requestor. See Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); see also *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

² We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information you marked and indicated relates to a pending criminal investigation and prosecution. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we conclude section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue, and the department may withhold the information you marked and indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Accordingly, the department must withhold the date of birth you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. We note the purpose of section 552.130 is to protect privacy. Because the right of privacy lapses at death, motor vehicle record information that pertains solely to a deceased individual may not be withheld under section 552.130. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984); H-917 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (“the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death”). Accordingly, with the exception of motor vehicle record information pertaining solely to a deceased individual we marked for release, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked, and the additional motor vehicle record information we marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, the remaining motor vehicle record information, which we marked for release, pertains to a deceased individual. Therefore, the department may not withhold the remaining motor vehicle record information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the social security number of a living person. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147. Upon review, we agree the department may withhold the social security number you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may withhold the information you marked and indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the date of birth you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of motor vehicle record information pertaining solely to a deceased individual we marked for release, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked and we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security number you marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James M. Graham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JMG/jxd

Ref: ID# 812336

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)