



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 14, 2020

Mr. Edward Konop
Associate Compliance Specialist
Texas Windstorm Insurance Association
P.O. Box 99090
Austin, Texas 78709-9090

OR2020-04846

Dear Mr. Konop:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 811782.

The Texas Windstorm Insurance Association ("TWIA") received two requests from different requestors for information pertaining to a specified meeting, certain salary information, and information related to marketing and consulting. You state TWIA does not have information responsive to a portion of the request.¹ You inform us TWIA will redact information pursuant to sections 552.024(c) of the Government Code and Open Records Decision 684 (2009).² You claim some of the submitted information is excepted

¹ The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when a request for information was received or to prepare new information in response to a request. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266, 267-68 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

² Section 552.024(c)(2) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact information protected by section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting a decision under the Act if the current or former employee or official to whom the information pertains timely chooses not to allow public access to the information. *See Gov't Code* § 552.024(c)(2). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general opinion.

from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.104, 552.107, and 552.136 of the Government Code.³ Additionally, you state release of this information may implicate the proprietary interests of A Girl Creative Design Studio; Austin Web and Design; Foundry Digital; Hahn Public Communications; Keybridge Communications, LLC; Leff Communications; Pierpoint; and Tim Rosa Associates, LLC. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified these third parties of the request for information and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the information at issue should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.⁴

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from any third party explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude any third party has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, TWIA may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest any third party may have in the information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. TWIA asserts the information at issue is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act (the "GLB Act") and relevant state insurance regulations. *See* 15 U.S.C. §§ 6801-6809; Ins. Code §§ 601.002 (covered entity must comply with 15 U.S.C. §§ 6802-6803), .051 (commissioner of insurance shall adopt rules necessary to carry out and keep privacy requirements consistent with GLB Act); 28 T.A.C. §§ 22.1-22.26. The purpose of the GLB Act is to promote competition in the

³ Although you also raise section 552.022(a)(16) of the Government Code, we note section 552.022 is not an exception to disclosure. Rather, section 552.022 enumerates categories of information that are not excepted from disclosure unless they are made confidential under the Act or other law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.022. Although you also raise Texas Rule of Evidence 503, we note the proper exception to raise when asserting the attorney-client privilege for information not subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code is section 552.107 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 676 at 1-2 (2002).

⁴ We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

financial services industry. *See* H.R. Conf. Rep. No. 106-434, at 245 (1999), *reprinted in* 1999 U.S.C.C.A.N. 245, 245. Reflecting Congressional concern regarding the dissemination of consumers' personal financial information, the GLB Act provides certain privacy protections "to protect the security and confidentiality of [consumers'] nonpublic personal information." 15 U.S.C. § 6801(a). The statute defines nonpublic personal information ("NPI") as "personally identifiable financial information ["PIFI"] - (i) provided by a consumer to a financial institution; (ii) resulting from any transaction with the consumer or any service performed for the consumer; or (iii) otherwise obtained by the financial institution." *Id.* § 6809(4)(A); *see id.* § 6809(4)(C)(I) (PIFI includes "any list, description, or other grouping of consumers (and publicly available information pertaining to them) that is derived using any [NPI]"). Federal regulations define PIFI as

any information: (i) [a] consumer provides to [a regulated financial institution] to obtain a financial product or service . . . ; (ii) [a]bout a consumer resulting from any transaction involving a financial product or service between [a regulated financial institution] and a consumer; or (iii) [a regulated financial institution] otherwise obtain[s] about a consumer in connection with providing a financial product or service to that consumer.

16 C.F.R. § 313.3(o)(1). Sections 6802(a) and (b) of title 15 of the United States Code provide in pertinent part as follows:

(a) Notice requirements

Except as otherwise provided in this subchapter, a financial institution may not, directly or through any affiliate, disclose to a nonaffiliated third party any nonpublic personal information, unless such financial institution provides or has provided to the consumer a notice that complies with section 6803 of this title.

(b) Opt out

(1) In general

A financial institution may not disclose nonpublic personal information to a nonaffiliated third party unless –

(A) such financial institution clearly and conspicuously discloses to the consumer, in writing or in electronic form or other form permitted by the regulations prescribed under section 6804 of this title, that such information may be disclosed to such third party;

(B) the consumer is given the opportunity, before the time that such information is initially disclosed, to direct that such information not be disclosed to such third party; and

(C) the consumer is given an explanation of how the consumer can exercise that nondisclosure option.

15 U.S.C. § 6802(a), (b). “Nonaffiliated third party” is defined as “any entity that is not an affiliate of, or related by common ownership or affiliated by corporate control with, the financial institution, but does not include a joint employee of such institution.” *Id.* § 6809(5). Section 6809(3)(A) of title 15 of the United States Code defines financial institution as “any institution the business of which is engaging in financial activities as described in section 1843(k) of Title 12.” 15 U.S.C. § 6809(3)(A). Section 1843(k)(4)(B) of title 12 defines the following activity as financial in nature: “Insuring, guaranteeing, or indemnifying against loss, harm, damage, illness, disability, or death, or providing and issuing annuities, and acting as principal, agent, or broker for purposes of the foregoing, in any State.” 12 U.S.C. § 1843(k)(4)(B).

Similarly, subchapter A of chapter 22 of the Texas Administrative Code governs the treatment of nonpublic personal information about individuals by covered entities. 28 T.A.C. § 22.1(a); *see id.* § 22.1(b) (providing scope of subchapter A of chapter 22). A covered entity is defined as “[a]n individual or entity who receives an authorization from the Texas Department of Insurance[,]” including an individual or entity to which chapter 82 of the Insurance Code is applicable. *Id.* § 22.2(11) (defining “covered entity”); *see also* Ins. Code § 82.002 (listing types of companies to which chapter 82 of Insurance Code applies). For purposes of subchapter A, “nonpublic personal financial information” includes

- (i) personally identifiable financial information;
- (ii) any list, description or other grouping of consumers (and publicly available information pertaining to them) that is derived using any personally identifiable financial information that is not publicly available; and
- (iii) any list of individuals’ names and street addresses that is derived in whole or in part using personally identifiable financial information that is not publicly available, such as account numbers.

28 T.A.C. § 22.2(21)(A). Section 22.14 of title 28 of the Texas Administrative Code provides as follows:

(a) Conditions for disclosure. Except as otherwise authorized in this subchapter, a covered entity may not, directly or through any affiliate, disclose any nonpublic personal financial information about a consumer to a nonaffiliated third party unless:

- (1) the covered entity has provided to the consumer an initial notice as required under § 22.8 of this title (relating to Initial Privacy Notice);

(2) the covered entity has provided to the consumer an opt out notice as required in § 22.11 of this title (relating to Form of Opt Out Notice to Consumers and Opt Out Methods);

(3) the covered entity has given the consumer a reasonable opportunity, before it discloses the information to the nonaffiliated third party, to opt out of the disclosure; and

(4) the consumer does not opt out.

28 T.A.C. § 22.14(a). For purposes of section 22.14, a nonaffiliated third party is “[a]n entity that is not an affiliate of, or related to by common ownership or affiliated by corporate control with, the covered entity.” *Id.* § 22.2(20).

TWIA is an association composed of all property insurers authorized to engage in the business of property insurance in Texas, other than insurers prevented by law from writing on a statewide basis coverages available through TWIA. Ins. Code § 2210.051(a); *see id.* §§ 2210.006, .051(b) (to engage in business of insurance in Texas, property insurer must be member of TWIA); *see also* 28 T.A.C. § 5.4001(c)(2)(D). The primary purpose of TWIA is to provide an adequate market for windstorm and hail insurance in Texas seacoast territories. Ins. Code § 2210.001. In addition, you state TWIA is an insurance company. *See id.* §§ 2210.053(a)(1), .203(a); *see also Tex. Windstorm Ins. Ass’n v. Poole*, 255 S.W.3d 775, 777 (Tex. App.—Amarillo 2008, pet. denied) (TWIA has “attributes of a private insurance business while operating under a governmental cloak”). Based on these representations, we agree TWIA is a financial institution for purposes of the GLB Act and a covered entity for purposes of section 22.14. You state the requestors are non-affiliated third parties. *See* 15 U.S.C. § 6809(5); 28 T.A.C. § 22.2(20).

You seek to withhold the information at issue under the GLB Act and chapter 22 of title 28 of the Texas Administrative Code. You state this information was provided to TWIA for the purpose of obtaining insurance and is also information resulting from transactions with the insured or services performed for the insured by TWIA, a regulated financial institution. *See* 15 U.S.C. § 6809(4)(A); 16 C.F.R. § 313.3(o)(1). You state TWIA has not provided opt out notices to the insured. Based upon your representations and our review, we agree this information falls under the definition of PIFI. *See generally Individual Reference Servs. Group, Inc. v. Federal Trade Comm’n*, 145 F. Supp. 2d 6, 26-31 (D.D.C. 2001) (discussing language, structure, and history of GLB Act to determine whether certain information meets definition of PIFI). We also agree this information consists of nonpublic personal financial information for purposes of section 22.14. Based on your representations and our review, we determine TWIA is prohibited by section 6802(a) and (b) of title 15 of the United States Code and section 22.14(a) of title 28 of the Texas Administrative Code from releasing the information at issue; therefore, TWIA must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with the GLB Act.

Section 552.104(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information that, if released, would give advantage to a competitor or bidder.” Gov’t Code § 552.104(a). The “test under section 552.104 is whether knowing another bidder’s [or competitor’s

information] would be an advantage, not whether it would be a decisive advantage.” *Boeing Co. v. Paxton*, 466 S.W.3d 831 (Tex. 2015). While you argue the release of the submitted information could harm third parties by giving an advantage to their competitors, such an interest in protecting the information belongs to the third parties and not TWIA. Therefore, we find TWIA may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.104(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.107(1) of the Government Code protects information coming within the attorney-client privilege. When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. ORD 676 at 6-7. First, a governmental body must demonstrate that the information constitutes or documents a communication. *Id.* at 7. Second, the communication must have been made “to facilitate the rendition of professional legal services” to the client governmental body. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). The privilege does not apply when an attorney or representative is involved in some capacity other than that of providing or facilitating professional legal services to the client governmental body. *In re Tex. Farmers Ins. Exch.*, 990 S.W.2d 337, 340 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1999, orig. proceeding) (attorney-client privilege does not apply if attorney acting in a capacity other than that of attorney). Governmental attorneys often act in capacities other than that of professional legal counsel, such as administrators, investigators, or managers. Thus, the mere fact that a communication involves an attorney for the government does not demonstrate this element. Third, the privilege applies only to communications between or among clients, client representatives, lawyers, and lawyer representatives. TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). Thus, a governmental body must inform this office of the identities and capacities of the individuals to whom each communication at issue has been made. Lastly, the attorney-client privilege applies only to a *confidential* communication, *Id.*, meaning it was “not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those: (A) to whom disclosure is made to further the rendition of professional legal services to the client; or (B) reasonably necessary to transmit the communication.” *Id.* 503(a)(5). Whether a communication meets this definition depends on the *intent* of the parties involved at the time the information was communicated. *Osborne v. Johnson*, 954 S.W.2d 180, 184 (Tex. App.—Waco 1997, orig. proceeding). Moreover, because the client may elect to waive the privilege at any time, a governmental body must explain that the confidentiality of a communication has been maintained. Section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege unless otherwise waived by the governmental body. *See Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein).

You state Exhibit C consists of a communication between TWIA attorneys and TWIA employees. You state the communication was made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to TWIA. You further state this communication was intended to be confidential and has remained confidential. Based on your representations and our review, we find you have demonstrated the applicability of the attorney-client privilege to Exhibit C. Thus, TWIA may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code states “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). We note check numbers are not access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, with the exception of the check numbers, TWIA must withhold the information you marked and the additional information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, TWIA must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the GLB Act. TWIA may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code. With the exception of the check numbers, TWIA must withhold the information you marked and the additional information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. TWIA must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kelly McWethy
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KM/gw

Ref: ID# 811782

c: 2 Requestors

c: 8 Third Parties