



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 11, 2020

Mr. Grant D. Blaies
Counsel for Clay County
Blaies & Hightower, L.L.P.
420 Throckmorton Street, Suite 1200
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2020-04157

Dear Mr. Blaies:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 811075.

The Clay County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to the death of a named inmate. You state the sheriff's office is redacting motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.108, 552.117, and 552.1175 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes a custodial death report. Article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides that, with the exception of any portion of the custodial death report the Office of the Attorney General ("OAG") determines is privileged, the OAG shall make the report public. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.18(b). The format of the report was revised in May 2006 and now consists of four pages and an attached summary of how the death occurred. The OAG has determined the four-page report and summary must be released to the public but any other documents submitted with the revised report are confidential under article 49.18(b). Although you claim the submitted custodial

¹ Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

death report is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, the exceptions to disclosure found in the Act do not generally apply to information that other statutes make public. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must release the submitted custodial death report pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Next, we note the remaining information contains court-filed documents subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record," unless the information is made confidential under the Act or other law. Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although you seek to withhold this information under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold the court-filed documents, which we marked, under section 552.108. We also note common-law privacy is not applicable to information contained in public court records. *See Austin Chronicle Corp. v. City of Austin*, No. 03-08-00596-CV, 2009 WL 483232 (Tex. App.—Austin Feb. 24, 2009, no pet.) (mem. op., not designated for publication); *see also Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn*, 420 U.S. 496 (1975) (action for invasion of privacy cannot be maintained where information is in public domain); *Star-Telegram v. Walker*, 834 S.W.2d 54 (Tex. 1992) (law cannot recall information once in public domain). Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold information contained in the marked court-filed documents under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. As you raise no further exceptions to disclosure of this information, the sheriff's office must release the court-filed documents we marked pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. However, we will address your arguments against disclosure of the remaining information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information at issue pertains to ongoing criminal investigations conducted by the sheriff's office and Texas Rangers. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers

to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d 177 at 186-88; see also Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

In summary, the sheriff's office must release the submitted custodial death report pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure and the court-filed documents we marked pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. With the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the sheriff's office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Blake Brennan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BBX/be

Ref: ID# 811075

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.