



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 4, 2020

Mr. William Overton
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2020-03245

Dear Mr. Overton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 810185 (OGC# PP0173, OIG# 1900003737).

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice and the Office of Inspector General of the Texas Department of Criminal Justice (collectively, the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual. You state the department has released the submitted custodial death report. *See* Code Crim. Proc. art. 49.18(b). You state the department will redact some information pursuant to sections 552.1175 and 552.147 of the Government Code and pursuant to previous determinations issued by this office, including Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067 (2005).¹ You claim the submitted information is

¹ Section 552.1175(f) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact under section 552.1175(b), without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office, the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security number, date of birth, and family member information of certain individuals who properly elect to keep this information confidential. *See* Gov't Code § 552.1175(b), (f). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b). Open Records Letter No. 2005 01067 serves as a previous determination permitting the department to withhold the present and former home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former employees of the department, regardless of whether they comply with section 552.1175 of the Government Code, under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code without requesting a decision from this office. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code).

excepted from disclosure under section 552.101, 552.102, 552.108, 552.122, 552.134, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.² We have also received and considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that interested party may submit written comments regarding why information should or should not be released).

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state Exhibit C relates to an ongoing criminal investigation, and release of that information would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of the case. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of Exhibit C would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to Exhibit C.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.134 of the Government Code relates to information about inmates of the department. This exception provides, in relevant part:

(a) Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is excepted from [required public

² We assume that the “representative sample” of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information, except to note basic information is generally not excepted under section 552.134 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.029(8) (basic information pertaining to alleged crime involving inmate not excepted under section 552.134).

disclosure] if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). Section 552.029 of the Government Code provides, in part:

Notwithstanding Section . . . 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the [department] is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

...

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Id. § 552.029(8). Thus, section 552.134 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029. You state the submitted information pertains to an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by the department. Upon review, we agree the remaining information is subject to section 552.134 of the Government Code. Although you assert section 552.029 of the Government Code does not apply to the remaining information, we find some of the remaining information pertains to crimes involving the named inmate and the death of the named inmate. Thus, the department must release basic information about the crimes involving the named inmate and the death of the named inmate pursuant to section 552.029. The basic information that must be released includes the time and place of the incident, the names of inmates and of department employees who were directly involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained by anyone involved, and information regarding any criminal charges or disciplinary actions that were filed as a result of the incident.⁴ Accordingly, except for basic information under section 552.029(8) of the Government Code, the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.134 of the Government Code.⁵

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC

⁴ We note basic information does not include the identities of witnesses.

⁵ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). *See generally* Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411. Upon review, we find no portion of the basic information consists of CHRI and the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently, and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy" which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). After review of the information at issue, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any portion of the basic information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the basic information under section 552.101 on the basis of constitutional privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. Except for basic information under section 552.029(8) of the Government Code, which must also be released, the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.134 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open

Mr. William Overton- Page 5

Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Emily Kunst". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, stylized "E" and a long, sweeping underline.

Emily Kunst
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EK/mo

Ref: ID# 810185

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)