



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 31, 2020

Mr. James Kopp
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P.O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2020-03098

Dear Mr. Kopp:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 809369 (ORR# W290345).

The San Antonio Police Department (the "department") received two requests from different requestors for report number SAPD-2019-1301423. The department claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code is applicable to emergency 9-1-1 districts established in accordance with chapter 772. See Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). This section makes the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier confidential. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.218 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 1.5 million. The department states it is part of an emergency communication district established under section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code. Upon review, we conclude the department must withhold the telephone number it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.218 of the Health and

¹ Although the department does not raise section 552.136 of the Government Code in its brief, we understand the department to raise this exception based on its markings.

Safety Code if the number consists of the originating telephone number furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. If the marked information does not consist of the originating telephone number provided by a 9-1-1 service supplier, it may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 772.218.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides “an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection with a motor vehicle record.” Transp. Code § 730.004. “Personal information” means “information that identifies a person,” and includes a person’s photograph, social security number, driver identification number, name, address but not zip code, telephone number, or medical and disability information. *Id.* § 730.003(6). The Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) is an “agency” for purposes of chapter 730. *See id.* § 730.003(1) (“agency” is state agency that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records). The department states some of the remaining information consists of records that were obtained by the department from DPS. *See id.* § 730.007(a)(2)(A)(i) (personal information may be disclosed to government agency in carrying out its functions). An authorized recipient of personal information may not re-disclose the personal information and to do so is a misdemeanor offense. *Id.* § 730.013(a), (d). Accordingly, the department must withhold the driver identification numbers, names, addresses but not zip codes, telephone numbers, and medical or disability information of the individuals in the marked information the department received from DPS under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 730.004 and 730.013 of the Transportation Code. However, the remaining information the department marked is not confidential under section 730.004 or 730.013 of the Transportation Code and the department may not withhold that information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information, which we marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must generally withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal

identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must generally withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, "Notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the department must generally withhold the insurance policy numbers within the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

However, we note sections 552.130 and 552.136 of the Government Code protect personal privacy. Further, we note the second requestor is an attorney for one of the individuals whose privacy interest is at issue. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) ("person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Thus, the second requestor has a right of access to information pertaining to his client that would otherwise be confidential under common-law privacy. Accordingly, the department may not withhold information pertaining to the second requestor's client from the second requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy, section 552.130 of the Government Code, or section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the telephone number it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code if the number consists of the originating telephone number furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. The department must withhold the driver identification numbers, names, addresses but not zip codes, telephone numbers, and medical or disability information of the individuals in the marked information the department received from DPS under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 730.004 and 730.013 of the Transportation Code. The department must generally withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code, and the insurance policy numbers within the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code; however, the department may not withhold information pertaining to the second requestor's client from the second requestor on any of these bases. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Claire Morris Sloan". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/gw

Ref: ID# 809369

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)