



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 29, 2020

Ms. Kristen Mills
Open Records Specialist
Baytown Police Department
3200 North Main Street
Baytown, Texas 77521

OR2020-02773

Dear Ms. Mills:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 808642 (PIR# 16051).

The Baytown Police Department (the "department") received a request for seventeen specified incident reports. You state you will release some information to the requestor upon payment of costs. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see also id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Exhibit C involves juvenile offenders, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.008 apply. Accordingly, the department must generally withhold Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Id. § 261.201(a). You claim, and we agree, Exhibit D was used or developed in investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. You do not indicate the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information and, therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must generally withhold Exhibit D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).*

However, we note the requestor is a representative of the Baytown Housing Authority. Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) of title 42 of the United States Code, the federal Housing Opportunity Program Extension Act of 1996, provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law, . . . the National Crime Information Center, police departments, and other law enforcement agencies shall, upon request, provide information to public housing agencies regarding the criminal conviction records of adult applicants for, or tenants of, covered housing assistance for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction.” 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Section 1437d(q)(1)(C) provides, “[a] law enforcement agency described in subparagraph (A) shall provide information under this paragraph relating to any criminal conviction of a juvenile only to the extent that the release of such information is authorized under the law of the applicable State, tribe, or locality.” *Id.* § 1437d(q)(1)(C). In Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997), this office concluded a local housing authority is a noncriminal justice agency authorized by federal statute to receive criminal history record information (“CHRI”). ORD 655 at 4. CHRI consists of “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). The Department of Public Safety (the “DPS”) is required to provide CHRI to a noncriminal justice agency authorized to receive CHRI pursuant to a federal statute, executive order, or state statute. *Id.* § 411.083(b)(2). Nevertheless, the federal law limits the purposes for which a public housing authority may request CHRI. The federal law provides, among other things, CHRI may only be used for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A); ORD 655 at 3-5. Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) states a housing authority shall be provided access to the CHRI “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law[.]” 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Based on this language, we find section 1437d(q)(1)(A) prevails over sections 58.008 and 261.201 of the Family Code. *Cf. Equal Employment Opportunity Comm’n v. City of Orange, Texas*, 905 F. Supp. 381, 382 (E.D. Tex. 1995) (federal law prevails over inconsistent provision of state law).

The requestor does not indicate whether Exhibits C and D will be used for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction. Accordingly, we must rule in the alternative. To the extent the requestor will use Exhibits C and D for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, the department must release any CHRI of applicants or tenants of public housing within the information at issue in accordance with section 1437d(q)(1) of chapter 42 of the United States Code. *See also* 24 C.F.R. § 5.903 (describing public housing authorities’ access to criminal records). However, to the extent the requestor will not use the requested information for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, the department must not release CHRI.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). You state the

information you have marked in Exhibit E under section 552.108(a)(1) relates to pending criminal investigations or prosecutions. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, the department may withhold the information you have marked in Exhibit E under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the department must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth you have marked in Exhibit E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130. Thus, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked in Exhibit E under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must generally withhold Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code and must generally withhold Exhibit D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. However, to the extent the requestor will use the requested information for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, the department must release any CHRI of applicants or tenants of public housing within Exhibits C and D in accordance with section 1437d(q)(1) of chapter 42 of the United States Code. The department may withhold the information you have marked in Exhibit E under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth you have marked in Exhibit E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked in Exhibit E under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument to withhold this information.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Tim Neal', written in a cursive style.

Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/gw

Ref: ID# 808642

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)