



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 29, 2020

Ms. Cynthia Trevino
Counsel for the City of Copperas Cove
Denton Navarro Rocha Bernal & Zech, P.C.
2517 North Main Avenue
San Antonio, Texas 78212-4685

OR2020-02683

Dear Ms. Trevino:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 809276 (ORR# W005748).

The Copperas Cove Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for all reports involving the requestor during a specified time period. The department states it is releasing some of the requested information. The department claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department states report number 10-1449 pertains to an active criminal investigation by the department. However, we note the information at issue relates to an alleged theft offense that occurred in 2010. The statute of limitations for the theft offense is two years from the date of the offense. *See* Penal Code § 31.03(e)(3) (theft); *see also* Crim. Proc. Code art. 12.02(a) (indictment or information for Class A Misdemeanor theft must be presented within two years). More than two years have elapsed since the events giving rise to the theft incident, and the department does not inform this office any criminal charges were filed within the limitations periods. Further, the department has not otherwise demonstrated release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. Therefore, we find the

department has not demonstrated the applicability of section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code to information at issue, and the department may not withhold report number 10-1449 on that basis. However, we will consider the applicability of other exceptions to disclosure of this information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). The department states report numbers 10-2394 and 10-3505 relate to closed criminal investigations that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on this representation and our review, we agree the department may withhold the information it marked in report numbers 10-2394 and 10-3505 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find some of the information at issue, which we marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the requestor's date of birth, to which the requestor has a right of access pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code, the department must also withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (“person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department

must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may withhold the information it marked in report numbers 10-2394 and 10-3505 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the requestor's date of birth, the department must also withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/mo

Ref: ID# 809276

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)