



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 9, 2020

Mr. Fernando C. Gomez
Vice Chancellor and General Counsel
The Texas State University System
601 Colorado Street
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2020-00841

Dear Mr. Gomez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 805450 (File No. 19077.25).

Texas State University (the "university") received a request for certain lecture slides. The university claims the submitted information is not subject to the Act. In the alternative, the university claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Additionally, the university states release of the information at issue may implicate the proprietary interests of Pearson Education, Inc. ("Pearson"). Accordingly, the university states, and provides documentation showing, it notified Pearson of the request for information and of its right to submit arguments to this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, the university argues the submitted information is not "public information" subject to disclosure under the Act. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as information that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:
 - (A) owns the information;

(B) has a right of access to the information; or

(C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or

(3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). Information is "in connection with the transaction of official business" if it is "created by, transmitted to, received by, or maintained by an officer or employee of the governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity, or a person or entity performing official business or a government function on behalf of a governmental body, and pertains to official business of the governmental body." *Id.* § 552.002(a-1). Thus, virtually all the information in a governmental body's physical possession constitutes public information and is subject to the Act. *Id.*; see Open Records Decision Nos. 549 at 4 (1990), 514 at 1-2 (1988). The university contends the submitted information is not subject to the Act. Upon review, however, we find the information at issue was collected and is maintained by the university in connection with the transaction of official university business. Thus, the submitted information is subject to the Act, and the university must release it unless it falls within an exception to public disclosure under the Act. See Gov't Code §§ 552.006, .021, .301, .302.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 51.914(a)(1) of the Education Code, which reads as follows:

(a) In order to protect the actual or potential value, the following information is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], or otherwise:

(1) all information relating to a product, device, or process, the application or use of such a product, device, or process, and all technological and scientific information (including computer programs) developed in whole or in part at a state institution of higher education, regardless of whether patentable or capable of being registered under copyright or trademark laws, that have a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee[.]

Educ. Code § 51.914(a)(1). As noted in Open Records Decision No. 651 (1997), the legislature is silent as to how this office or a court is to determine whether particular scientific information has "a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee[.]" ORD 651 at 9-10. Furthermore, whether particular scientific information has such a potential is a question of fact that this office is unable to resolve in the opinion process. See *id.* at 10. Thus, this office has stated in considering whether requested information has "a potential

for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee[.]” we will rely on a governmental body’s assertion that the information has this potential. *See id.* However, a governmental body’s determination that information has a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee is subject to judicial review. *See id.* We note section 51.914 is not applicable to working titles of experiments or other information that does not reveal the details of the research. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 557 at 3 (1990), 497 at 6-7.

We note the university is an institution of higher education. *See* Educ. Code § 61.003(3). The university states the submitted information consists of teaching materials developed, in part, by a university employee. The university also states the information at issue has the potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee and is, therefore, confidential pursuant to section 51.914(a)(1). Upon review, we find the university has demonstrated the applicability of section 51.914 of the Education Code to the information at issue. Accordingly, the university must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 51.914 of the Education Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James M. Graham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JMG/jxd

Ref: ID# 805450

c: Requestor

Third Party