



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 20, 2019

Mr. Andrew Heston
Assistant District Attorney
Brazoria County
111 East Locust, Suite 408A
Angleton, Texas 77515

OR2019-36323

Dear Mr. Heston:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 804113 (Reference No. 19-1610).

The Brazoria County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for twenty-five categories of information pertaining to a specified accident. You state the sheriff's office will redact motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you only submitted a call sheet, a CR-3 accident report, dashboard camera recordings, and an incident report in response to the request for information. To the extent any additional information responsive to the request existed on the date the sheriff's office received the request, we assume the sheriff's office has released it. If the sheriff's office has not released any such information, it must do so at this time. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

Next, we must address the obligations of the sheriff's office under the Act. Section 552.301 describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state

¹ Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). In this instance, the sheriff's office received the request for information on September 30, 2019. You do not inform us the sheriff's office was closed for any business days between September 30, 2019, and October 14, 2019. Thus, the sheriff's office was required to provide the information required by section 552.301(b) by October 14, 2019. We note the envelope containing the information required by section 552.301(b) bears a certified mail tracking number showing it was mailed on October 15, 2019. *See id.* § 552.308 (prescribing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, we find the sheriff's office failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). You claim sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code for the submitted information. Because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address the applicability of this exception to the submitted information. However, we find you failed to establish a compelling reason to address your remaining claim against disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

In this instance, the requestor has not demonstrated they are a person listed under section 550.065(c). Thus, the submitted CR-3 accident report is confidential under section 550.065(b), and the sheriff's office must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, section 550.065(c-1) requires the sheriff's office to create a redacted accident report that may be requested by any person. *Id.* § 550.065(c-1). The redacted accident report may not include the information listed in subsection (f)(2). *Id.* Therefore, the requestor has a right of access to the redacted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must release the redacted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth within the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the submitted CR-3 accident report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code, but must release the redacted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code. The sheriff's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth within the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James M. Graham
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JMG/

Ref: ID# 804113

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)