



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 16, 2019

Ms. Kristi Godden
Counsel for La Joya Independent School District
O'Hanlon, Demerath & Castillo
808 West Avenue
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2019-35511

Dear Ms. Godden:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 801844 (LJISD-19-056).

The La Joya Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to request for proposals number 6251460, Math and Reading Software Subscription and Related Services, including: (1) a copy of the contract and winning proposal; (2) the evaluation criteria and source selection plan used to select the winner; and (3) the agency evaluation notes, comments, and scoring of each offeror. Although the district takes no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, the district states release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of Renaissance Learning, Inc. ("Renaissance Learning"). Accordingly, the district states, and provides documentation showing, it notified Renaissance Learning of the request for information and of the right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released.¹ *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have reviewed the submitted information.

¹ We note the district failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting a ruling from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Nonetheless, because third-party interests can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider the submitted argument against release of the submitted information. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from Renaissance Learning explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude Renaissance Learning has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Accordingly, the district may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest Renaissance Learning may have in the information. As no exceptions to disclosure have been raised, the district must release the submitted information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Katie Stallcup
Attorney
Open Records Division

AKS/eb

Ref: ID# 801844

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)