



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 4, 2019

Ms. Nena Chima-Tetteh
Assistant City Attorney
Arlington Police Department
Mail Stop 04-0200
PO Box 1065
Arlington, Texas 76004-1065

OR2019-34041

Dear Ms. Chima-Tetteh:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 799530 (Reference Nos. 86994 and 88360).

The Arlington Police Department (the "department") received two requests from two requestors for report #2019-02250779 and one request from the second requestor for report #2019-02471006. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Act of May 14, 2019, 86th Leg., R.S., H.B. 1760, § 4 (to be codified at Fam. Code § 58.008(b)); *see also* Fam. Code § 51.03 (a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017.¹ *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22, 2017 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3173, 3187. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Upon review, we find the submitted information does not involve a juvenile identified as a suspect, offender, or defendant. Therefore, we find the department has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 58.008 of the Family Code to any portion of the submitted information, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

¹ Although you raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code, we note the 85th Legislature repealed this provision effective September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 21, 2017 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3173, 3187. Thus we understand you to raise section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law.

(3) the identity of the person who made the report

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2),(3). The second requestor seeks report #2019-02471006. Upon review, we find report #2019-02471006 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find report #2019-02471006 is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. However, we note the second requestor is the parent of the child victim named in the information at issue, and the parent is not alleged to have committed the abuse. Therefore, the department may not withhold report #2019-02471006 from the second requestor under section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, we note section 261.201(1)(3) states the identity of the reporting party shall be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(3). Accordingly, we find the department must withhold the identifying information of the reporting party, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code. In addition, section 261.201 (1)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must still be withheld from disclosure. *See id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Thus, we will consider your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code for report #2019-02471006.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection,

investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Your state report #2019-02471006 relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based on your representation and our review, we find release of report #2019-02471006 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to report #2019-02471006.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the basic information, the department may withhold report #2019-02471006 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. As noted above, section 261.201(1)(3) states the identity of the reporting party shall be withheld from disclosure. Fam. Code § 261.201(1)(3). Accordingly, the department must withhold the identity of the reporting party, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (“MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created

by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate any portion of the remaining information consists of a physician-patient communication or a record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that was created or is maintained by a physician. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note, however, the requestors have a right of access to private information concerning themselves and their minor children. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a), (b) (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Thus, the requestors have a right of access to information pertaining to themselves and their minor children that would otherwise be private. We also note information belonging to an individual who has been de-identified may not be withheld under common-law privacy as the de-identified individual's privacy interests are protected. Upon review, the department has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information from these requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.


In summary, with the exception of the basic information, the department may withhold report #2019-02471006 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing basic information, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code. The department must release the remaining information.²

² We note the information being released contains information to which the requestors have a right of access. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k); *see also* Gov't Code § 552.023; ORD 481 at 4. Accordingly, if the department receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, it must again seek a ruling from this office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kelly McWethy
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KM/gw

Ref: ID# 799530

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)