



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 21, 2019

Ms. Raika Rowe
Public Information Coordinator
Texas Alcoholic Beverage Commission
P.O. Box 13127
Austin, Texas 78711-3127

OR2019-32988

Dear Ms. Rowe:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 797877 (TABC# R001633-090319).

The Texas Alcoholic Beverage Commission (the "commission") received a request for all documents related to a specified complaint. You state you have released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a).

This office has held that “litigation” within the meaning of section 552.103 includes contested cases conducted in a quasi-judicial forum. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 474 (1987), 368 (1983), 301 (1982). For instance, this office has held that cases conducted under the Texas Administrative Procedure Act (the “APA”), chapter 2001 of the Government Code, constitute “litigation” for purposes of section 552.103. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 588 at 7 (1991) (construing statutory predecessor to the APA). We further note a contested case before the State Office of Administrative Hearings (the “SOAH”) is considered litigation for purposes of the APA. *See id.* In determining whether an administrative proceeding is conducted in a quasi-judicial forum, this office has considered the following factors: (1) whether the dispute is, for all practical purposes, litigated in an administrative proceeding where (a) discovery takes place, (b) evidence is heard, (c) factual questions are resolved, (d) a record is made, and (2) whether the proceeding is an adjudicative forum of first jurisdiction, *i.e.*, whether judicial review of the proceeding in district court is an appellate review and not the forum for resolving a controversy on the basis of evidence. *See* ORD 588.

The commission states, and provides documentation showing, the submitted information pertains to an administrative case that was filed prior to the date it received the instant request for information. We note commission hearings are conducted by the SOAH and governed by the APA. *See* Alco. Bev. Code § 5.43 (designating SOAH to conduct certain administrative hearings); 16 TAC § 37.2 (requiring all contested cases under the Alcoholic Beverage Code to comply with the APA). Based on the commission’s representations and our review, we determine litigation was pending on the date the commission received the request for information. The commission also states, and we agree, the information at issue relates to the pending litigation for purposes of section 552.103. Accordingly, the commission may generally withhold the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

However, we note the information normally found on the front page of an offense or incident report is generally considered public. *Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976); *see* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976). This office has stated basic information about a crime may not be withheld under section 552.103 of the Government Code even if it is related to the litigation. Open Records Decision No.

362 (1983). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the commission may withhold the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code.¹

Additionally, we note once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to the opposing party in the litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a), and it must be disclosed. Further, the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the litigation has been concluded. Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Section 5.48 of the Alcoholic Beverage Code provides as follows:

(a) “Private records,” as used in this section, means all records of a permittee, licensee, or other person than the name, proposed location, and type of permit or license sought in an application for an original or renewal permit or license, or in a periodic report relating to the importation, distribution, or sale of alcoholic beverages required by the commission to be regularly filed by a permittee or licensee.

(b) The private records of a permittee, licensee, or other person that are required or obtained by the commission or its agents, in connection with an investigation or otherwise, are privileged unless introduced in evidence in a hearing before the commission or before a court in this state or the United States.

Alco. Bev. Code § 5.48. The term “privileged” in this statute has been construed to mean “confidential” for purposes of the Act. Attorney General Opinion JM-1235 at 2 (1990); Open Records Decision Nos. 186 (1978), 62 (1974). Thus, section 5.48 makes confidential any records required or obtained by the commission, with the exception of “the name, proposed location, and type of permit or license sought in an application for an original or renewal permit or license” and “a periodic report relating to the importation, distribution, or sale of alcoholic beverages required by the commission to be regularly filed by a permittee or licensee.” Alco. Bev. Code § 5.48.

You assert the remaining information is confidential pursuant to section 5.48. However, upon review, we find you failed to establish the information at issue consists of “private records” of a permittee, licensee, or other person required or obtained by the commission

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the commission’s assertion of section 552.108, except to note basic information described in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).

for purposes of section 5.48. Therefore, this information is not confidential under section 5.48 of the Alcoholic Beverage Code, and the commission may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this ground.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the commission may withhold the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kimbell Kesling
Attorney
Open Records Division

KK/gw

Ref: ID# 797877

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)