



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 19, 2019

Mr. Joseph Behnke
Assistant General Counsel
Office of the Governor
P.O. Box 12428
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2019-32633

Dear Mr. Behnke:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 797480 (OOG ID# 353-19).

The Office of the Governor (the "governor's office") received a request for applications for appointment by present members of the Texas Board of Nursing (the "board") and any email correspondence between the governor's office and a named individual during a specified time period. The governor's office states it will redact dates of birth of members of the public pursuant to the previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2018-03412 (2018).¹ The governor's office states it is withholding information subject to sections 552.117 and 552.1175 of the Government Code and information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.² The governor's office further states it is withholding

¹Open Records Letter No. 2018-03412 authorizes the governor's office to withhold public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting an attorney general decision.

²Section 552.117 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). Section 552.024 of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to withhold information subject to section 552.117 without requesting a decision from this office if the current or former employee or official chooses not to allow public access to the information. *See id.* § 552.024(c). Section 552.1175(f) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact under section 552.1175(b), without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office, the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social

certain information pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).³ You claim the some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.111 of the Government Code. Additionally, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified the board of its right to submit arguments to this office as to why the information at issue should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released). We have received comments from the board. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.⁴

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. This exception encompasses section 301.466(a) of the Occupations Code, which provides as follows:

A complaint and investigation concerning a nurse under this subchapter, all information and material compiled by the board in connection with the complaint and investigation, and the information described by Subsection (d) are:

- (1) confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act]; and
- (2) not subject to disclosure, discovery, subpoena, or other means of legal compulsion for release to anyone other than the board or a board employee or agent involved in license holder discipline.

Occ. Code § 301.466(a). Section 301.466 only applies to information created or compiled by the board as part of an investigation by the board. The board states it created or compiled the information at issue as part of an investigation. The board also states the information does not fall into any of the categories of information that are subject to disclosure under section 301.466(c). Based on these representations, we agree the information at issue is confidential under section 301.466(a). Further, the requestor is not entitled to receive this information under section 301.466(b) and the information at issue does not fall under

security number, date of birth, and family member information of a peace officer as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure who properly elects to keep this information confidential. *See id.* § 552.1175(b), (f). Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See id.* § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

³Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

⁴We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

section 301.466(c). Accordingly, we conclude the governor's office must withhold the information we indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 301.466(a)(1) of the Occupations Code.⁵

Section 552.111 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a]n interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.111. This exception encompasses the deliberative process privilege. *See* Open Records Decision No. 615 at 2 (1993). The purpose of section 552.111 is to protect advice, opinion, and recommendation in the decisional process and to encourage open and frank discussion in the deliberative process. *See Austin v. City of San Antonio*, 630 S.W.2d 391, 394 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 1982, writ ref’d n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 538 at 1-2 (1990).

In Open Records Decision No. 615, this office re-examined the statutory predecessor to section 552.111 in light of the decision in *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ). We determined section 552.111 excepts from disclosure only those internal communications that consist of advice, recommendations, opinions, and other material reflecting the policymaking processes of the governmental body. *See* ORD 615 at 5. A governmental body’s policymaking functions do not encompass routine internal administrative or personnel matters, and disclosure of information about such matters will not inhibit free discussion of policy issues among agency personnel. *Id.*; *see also City of Garland v. Dallas Morning News*, 22 S.W.3d 351 (Tex. 2000) (section 552.111 not applicable to personnel-related communications that did not involve policymaking). A governmental body’s policymaking functions do include administrative and personnel matters of broad scope that affect the governmental body’s policy mission. *See* Open Records Decision No. 631 at 3 (1995).

Further, section 552.111 does not protect facts and written observations of facts and events severable from advice, opinions, and recommendations. *Arlington Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 37 S.W.3d 152 (Tex. App.—Austin 2001, no pet.); *see* ORD 615 at 5. But if factual information is so inextricably intertwined with material involving advice, opinion, or recommendation as to make severance of the factual data impractical, the factual information also may be withheld under section 552.111. *See* Open Records Decision No. 313 at 3 (1982).

This office has also concluded a preliminary draft of a document intended for public release in its final form necessarily represents the drafter’s advice, opinion, and recommendation with regard to the form and content of the final document, so as to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.111. *See* Open Records Decision No. 559 at 2 (1990) (applying statutory predecessor). Section 552.111 protects factual information in the draft that also will be included in the final version of the document. *See id.* at 2-3. Thus, section

⁵ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

552.111 encompasses the entire contents, including comments, underlining, deletions, and proofreading marks, of a preliminary draft of a policymaking document that will be released to the public in its final form. *See id.* at 2.

You seek to withhold the information you marked under section 552.111 of the Government Code. You state the information at issue consists of advice, opinions, and recommendations of employees and officials of the governor's office and the board, which share a privity of interest, regarding policymaking matters. You further state that portions of the information at issue consist of draft documents that were intended to be released in their final forms. Accordingly, we find the governor's office may withhold the information it marked under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (public employee's withholding allowance certificate, designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and employee's decisions regarding voluntary benefit programs, among others, protected under common-law privacy). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we agree the information the governor's office marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the governor's office must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the governor's office must withhold the information we indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 301.466(a)(1) of the Occupations Code. The governor's office may withhold the information it marked under section 552.111 of the Government Code. The governor's office must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The governor's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and

responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Buchanan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EBO/jxd

Ref: ID# 797480

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)