



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 14, 2019

Mr. Peter G. Smith
City Attorney
City of Richardson
P.O. Box 831078
Richardson, Texas 75083-1078

OR2019-32130

Dear Mr. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 796734 (ORR# (P002824).

The Richardson Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified motor vehicle accident. You state the department released some information to the requestor with redactions made pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted body worn camera recordings were not properly requested pursuant to section 1701.661 of the Occupations Code. You also claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information is not responsive to the instant request for information because it does not pertain to the specified motor vehicle accident. This ruling does not address the public availability of information that is not responsive to the request and the department is not required to release such information in response to this request.

¹ Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

Next, as you acknowledge, the responsive information includes a peace officer's body worn camera recording. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code provides the following:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). Upon review, we find the requestor provided the requisite information under section 1701.661(a) for the body worn camera video at issue. As the body worn camera video was properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, we will consider whether this information is otherwise excepted from disclosure under the Act.

As noted above, you state the department will redact motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code. We note the remaining responsive information contains additional motor vehicle record information. Section 552.130 excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked, as well as the additional motor vehicle record information we indicated, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under common-law

privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, the department must withhold the information you marked and we indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has concluded insurance policy numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 at 9 (2009). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you marked and the information we indicated under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked, as well as the additional motor vehicle record information we indicated, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you marked and we indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information you marked and we indicated under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining responsive information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable

² We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released in this instance. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023(a) (“person or a person’s authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Accordingly, if the department receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.

charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Matthew Taylor
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MHT/mo

Ref: ID# 796734

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)