



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 5, 2019

Ms. Cary Grace
Assistant City Attorney
City of Austin
P.O. Box 1088
Austin, Texas 78767

OR2019-31197

Dear Ms. Grace:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 795558 (R022279).

The Austin Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to specified incident.¹ You state the department released some information, including the submitted DIC-24 form. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the department claims and reviewed the submitted information. We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

¹ We note the department received an initial request for the same information from this requestor on February 11, 2019. In response to the initial request, the department informs us it released basic information to the requestor within five business days and withheld certain information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, pursuant to the previous determination this office issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2016-10001 (2016). Subsequently, the requestor made a second request for the same information on August 16, 2019.

Initially, the requestor asserts some of the requested information was previously released to a member of the public. The Act does not permit selective disclosure of information to the public. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.007(b), .021; Open Records Decision No. 463 at 1-2 (1987). Information that has been voluntarily released to a member of the public may not subsequently be withheld from another member of the public, unless public disclosure of the information is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007(a); Open Records Decision Nos. 518 at 3 (1989), 490 at 2 (1988). Although the department seeks to withhold the submitted information under section 552.108, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). As such, section 552.108 does not expressly prohibit the release of information to the public nor does it make information confidential under the Act. Therefore, to the extent the department previously voluntarily released the submitted information to a member of the public, it may not now withhold any such information from the present requestor under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, we will address the department's arguments for the remaining information that was not previously released.

Next, we note the submitted information includes a court-filed document. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record" unless the information is expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. *Id.* § 552.022(a)(17). The department seeks to withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary-exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the department may not withhold the court-filed document, which we marked, under section 552.108. However, because section 552.130 of the Government Code makes information confidential for purposes of section 552.022, we will address its applicability to the court-filed document subject to section 552.022(a)(17).² Further, we also address the department's argument for the remaining information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department states the remaining

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

information relates to an open criminal case. However, the requestor argues the investigation is closed. Whether or not the requested information relates to a pending criminal prosecution is a question of fact. This office cannot resolve factual disputes in the opinion process. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 592 at 2 (1991), 552 at 4 (1990), 435 at 4 (1986). Where fact issues are not resolvable as a matter of law, we must rely on the facts alleged to us by the governmental body requesting our decision, or upon those facts that are discernible from the documents submitted for our inspection. *See* Open Records Decision No. 552 at 4 (1990). Thus, based on the department's representations, we accept the department's assertion the information at issue relates to a pending criminal investigation. Accordingly, we conclude the release of the remaining information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked in the court-filed document under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the court-filed document we marked pursuant to section 552.022 of the Government Code; however, in releasing the court-filed document the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. With the exception of basic information, which also must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable

charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Ramsey Abarca", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Ramsey A. Abarca
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RAA/gw

Ref: ID# 795558

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)