



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 5, 2019

Mr. Kevin Bailey
Assistant City Attorney
City of Midland
P.O. Box 1152
Midland, Texas 79702

OR2019-31144

Dear Mr. Bailey:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 795171 (Ref. No. M027618-082019).

The Midland Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in

courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The department asserts the submitted information is excepted under section 552.101 of the Government Code as a compilation of criminal history of the named individual. However, the requestor is the authorized representative of the named individual and, thus, has a special right of access to the named individual's private information that would ordinarily be withheld to protect his privacy interests. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a)-(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person or person's representative to whom information relates on grounds that information is considered confidential under privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by federal law. Exhibit B contains information that was reported to the National Trace Center of the Department of Justice Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco, Firearms and Explosives (the "ATF"). Public Law number 112-55 states, in pertinent part,

[D]uring the current fiscal year and in each fiscal year thereafter, no funds appropriated under [the Consolidated and Further Continuing Appropriations Act, 2012] or any other [a]ct may be used to disclose part or all of the contents of the Firearms Trace System database maintained by the National Trace Center of the [ATF] or any information required to be kept by licensees pursuant to section 923(g) of title 18, United States Code, or required to be reported pursuant to paragraphs (3) and (7) of such section, except to: (1) a Federal, State, local, or tribal law enforcement agency, or a Federal, State, or local prosecutor . . . unless such disclosure of such data to an[] . . . entit[y] described in (1) . . . of this proviso would compromise the identity of any undercover law enforcement officer or confidential informant, or interfere with any case under investigation; and no person or entity described in (1) . . . shall knowingly and publicly disclose such data; and all such data shall be immune from legal process, shall not be subject to subpoena or other discovery, shall be inadmissible in evidence, and shall not be used, relied on, or disclosed in any manner, nor shall testimony or other evidence be permitted based on the data, in a civil action in any State[.]

Consolidated and Further Continuing Appropriations Act, 2012, Pub. L. No. 112-55, 125 Stat. 552, 609-10 (2011). You assert the submitted information contains a Firearm Trace Summary maintained by the ATF. Upon review, we find the submitted Firearms Trace Summary is confidential under Public Law number 112-55 and the department must generally withhold the Firearms Trace Summary under section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See Miller v. U.S. Dep't of Justice*, 562 F. Supp. 2d 82, 111 (D.D.C. 2008) (holding Firearms Trace Report properly withheld under Freedom of Information Act exemption 3,

which covers records that are exempt from disclosure by statute). However, as you acknowledge, the requestor is a representative of the Probation Office of the United States District Court for the Western District of Texas (the “probation office”), a federal law enforcement agency. *See* Pub. Law 112-55, 125 Stat. 552. We have no indication the release of the information at issue to this requestor would compromise the identity of any undercover law enforcement officer or confidential informant, or interfere with any case under investigation. Therefore, the requestor has a right of access to the submitted Firearms Trace Summary pursuant to Public Law 112-55 and the department may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis. Accordingly, the department must release the submitted Firearms Trace Summary to this requestor in its entirety pursuant to Public Law 112-55.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov’t Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411. We note, however, active warrant information or other information relating to an individual’s current involvement in the criminal justice system does not constitute criminal history information for purposes of section 552.101. *See id.* § 411.081(b). We also note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). We further note Federal Bureau of Investigation (“FBI”) numbers constitute CHRI generated by the FBI. Upon review, we find some of the submitted information consists of CHRI which the department must generally withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

However, as noted above, the requestor is a representative of the probation office and may have a right of access to some of the submitted information. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety (the “DPS”)] any criminal history record information

[("CHRI")] maintained by the [DPS] about a person." *Id.* § 411.089(a). Additionally, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides, in part:

(a) [a] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from [DPS CHRI] maintained by [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). The submitted documents contain CHRI pertaining to the named individual. However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of CHRI). Thus, if the probation office is a "criminal justice agency," then the requestor is authorized to obtain CHRI pertaining to the named individual from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose. *See Gov't Code* §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2).

A "criminal justice agency" is defined in part as "a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]" *Id.* § 411.082(3)(A). "Administration of criminal justice" has the meaning assigned by article 66.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 66.001 of the Code of Criminal Procedure defines "administration of criminal justice" as "the detection, apprehension, detention, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of [CHRI]." *Crim. Proc. Code art. 66.001(1).*

The department received the instant request for information from the probation office. We understand the probation office is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082. *See Gov't Code* § 411.082(3)(A). We also understand the information at issue will be used for criminal justice purposes because the requestor indicates the probation office is conducting an investigation of the individual named in the request. Thus, the department must make CHRI pertaining to the named individual available to the requestor. *See Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986)* (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). However, the department must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

As stated above, section 552.101 of the Government of the Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). As noted above, the requestor has a right of access to the named individual's private information as his authorized representative. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Upon review, we conclude some of the remaining information meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, with the exception of the named individual's date of birth, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.¹ *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. We note, because section 552.130 protects privacy interests, as the authorized representative, the requestor has a right of access to the named individual's motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. However, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. With the exception of the named individual's date of birth, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.²

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481, 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

² We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b). However, as the named individual's authorized representative, the requestor has a right of access to the named individual's social security number, and the department may not withhold it under 552.147 of the Government Code. *See generally id.* § 552.023(b). We also note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Meagan Hunter". The signature is written in black ink and is positioned to the right of the word "Sincerely,".

Meagan Hunter
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MH/rm

Ref: ID# 795171

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)