



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 1, 2019

Ms. Stacie S. White  
Counsel for the Town of Flower Mound.  
Taylor, Olson, Adkins, Sralla & Elam, L. L. P.  
6000 Western Place, Suite 200  
Fort Worth, Texas 76107

OR2019-30937

Dear Ms. White:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 794877.

The Town of Flower Mound (the "town"), which you represent, received a request for all records related to a named individual during a specified time period. The town states it is withholding motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> The town further states it is withholding certain information pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).<sup>2</sup> The town claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the town claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which

---

<sup>1</sup> Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

<sup>2</sup> Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(B)* (criminal history record information does not include driving record information).

The present request seeks all reports pertaining to a named individual. This request requires the town to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the town maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the town must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note the town has submitted information that relates to routine traffic violations. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individual's criminal history, and the town may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy on that basis. Accordingly, we will address the applicability of other exceptions to disclosure of this information.

Some of the information at issue is protected under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101.

*See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we agree the information the town marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the town must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The town must also withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the town must withhold the additional motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the town maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the town must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The town must withhold the information it marked, as well as all public citizens' dates of birth, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The town must withhold the additional motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The town must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CVMS/jxd

Ms. Stacie S. White - Page 4

Ref: ID# 794877

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)