



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 22, 2019

Ms. Nicole Warren
Deputy City Attorney
City of Temple
2 North Main Street, Suite 308
Temple, Texas 76501

OR2019-29735

Dear Ms. Warren:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 792628.

The City of Temple (the "city") received a request for specified information related to an incident. You state you have released most of the information to the requestor. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). Upon our review of the submitted information, we determine the requestor provided the requisite information required by section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code. We note, however, section 1701.661(f) provides, in relevant part:

A law enforcement agency may not release any portion . . . of a recording involving the investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and does not result in arrest, without written authorization from the person who is the subject of that portion of the recording or, if the person is deceased, from the person's authorized representative.

Id. § 1701.661(f). You state the submitted body worn camera recording involves an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and that did not result in an arrest. You do not indicate you have permission for release from all of the subjects of the recording at issue. *See id.* Accordingly, we find the city must withhold the submitted body worn camera recording under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. However, the remaining information consists of a dashboard camera recording. We find this information does not consist of body worn camera recordings. Therefore, the remaining information is not subject to section 1701.661 of the Occupations Code, and the city may not withhold the remaining recording under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.¹ *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We note section 552.130 protects privacy interests. Accordingly, the requestor has a right of access to her client's motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023(a) ("person or a person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Thus, with the exception of information belonging to the requestor's client, the city must withhold all visible and audible license plates and license plate numbers in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

the requestor has a right of access to private information pertaining to her client pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, with the exception of the date of birth of the requestor's client, the city must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the city must withhold the submitted body worn camera recording under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. With the exception of information belonging to the requestor, the city must withhold all visible and audible license plates and license plate numbers in the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. With the exception of the date of birth of the requestor's client, the city must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Buchanan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EBO/jxd

Ref: ID# 792628

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

² We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, the city must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.