



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 16, 2019

Mr. Robert Schell
Assistant Ellis County & District Attorney
Ellis County
109 South Jackson Street
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2019-29075

Dear Mr. Schell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 791665.

The Ellis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to a specified accident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, 552.108, 552.136, and 552.137 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides, in part, the following:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

...

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

¹ Although the sheriff's office raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.085 of the Government Code, we understand it to raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

...

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

...

(2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2), (b)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) or section 552.108(b)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(2), (b)(2), .301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). The sheriff's office has not demonstrated the information at issue pertains to any specific investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, we find the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate the applicability of either section 552.108(a)(2) or section 552.108(b)(2) to the information at issue. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(2) or section 552.108(b)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *See id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See id.* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code* § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one's current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police

department allowed to disclose information pertaining to one's current involvement with the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find the information we marked consists of confidential CHRI. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any portion of the remaining information constitutes CHRI for purposes of chapter 411. Accordingly, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered to be intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate and embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (personal financial information includes choice of particular insurance carrier), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit report, financial statements, and other personal financial information). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find most of the information the sheriff's office marked consists of motor vehicle record information that is confidential under section 552.130. However, we find some of the information the sheriff's office marked does not consist of motor vehicle record information for purposes of section 552.130. This information, which we have indicated for release, may not be withheld on that basis. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we indicated for release, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *See id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has determined an insurance policy number is an access device for purposes of this exception. *See* Open

Records Decision No. 684 at 9 (2009). Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold the insurance policy number it marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address at issue is not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the personal e-mail address it marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the information we indicated for release, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the insurance policy number it marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the personal e-mail address it marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kimbell Kesling
Attorney
Open Records Division

KK/eb

Mr. Robert Schell - Page 5

Ref: ID# 791665

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)