



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 15, 2019

Mr. Jameson C. Baker
Counsel for Northside Independent School District
Walsh, Gallegos, Trevino, Russo, & Kyle, P.C.
P.O. Box 460606
San Antonio, Texas 78246

OR2019-28941

Dear Mr. Baker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 791459.

The Northside Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for the complete employment file of a named individual. You state you will redact information pursuant to section 552.147 and Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).¹ You argue portions of the submitted information are not subject to the Act. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.117, 552.119, 552.130, 552.136, 552.139, 552.152 of the Government Code.² We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you state the submitted information contains a peace officer's Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification number. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as information that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

¹ Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* § 552.147(b). Open Records Decision No. 684 serves as a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code. *See* ORD 684.

² Although you do not raise section 552.130 of the Government Code in your brief, we understand you to assert this exception based on your markings.

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:
 - (A) owns the information;
 - (B) has a right of access to the information; or
 - (C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information;
or
- (3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the commissioner's electronic database and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Accordingly, we find the officer's TCOLE identification number in the submitted information does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses information protected by chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See id.* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code* § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in

conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one's current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find a portion of the information at issue, which we have marked, consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 and federal law.³ However, we find you have not demonstrated the remaining information you have indicated consists of CHRI for purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code, and the district may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which provides in pertinent part, the following:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.002, .004. The information at issue consists of a report of the results of a drug test. We note section 159.001 of the MPA defines "patient" as "a person who, to receive medical care, consults with or is seen by a physician." *Id.* § 159.001(3). Because the individual at issue in the report did not receive medical care in the administration of the drug test, this individual is not a patient for purposes of section 159.002. Accordingly, the district may not withhold the information you have indicated under section 552.101 in conjunction with the MPA.

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to TCOLE under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code.¹ Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

(a) All information submitted to [TCOLE] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

(b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a [TCOLE] member or other person may not release information submitted under this subchapter.

Id. § 1701.454. The submitted information includes an F-5 form that was submitted to TCOLE pursuant to subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Furthermore, the information at issue does not indicate the officer resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. Therefore, the district must withhold the F-5 form we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1701.454.⁴

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (personal financial information includes choice of particular insurance carrier), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of

¹The Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education was renamed TCOLE by the 83rd Legislature. *See* Act of May 6, 2013, 83rd Leg., R.S., ch. 93, § 1.01, 2013 Tex. Gen. Laws 174, 174.

⁴ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the district must withhold the date of birth you marked and we marked under section 552.102(a).

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code applies to records a governmental body holds in an employment capacity and excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code, except as provided by section 552.024(a-1). Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(1); *see also id.* § 552.024(a-1). Section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988)* (statutory predecessor to section 552.117 of the Government Code not applicable to cellular telephone numbers provided and paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body’s receipt of the request for the information. *See Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989)*. Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body’s receipt of the request for the information. Upon review, we find some of the information you have marked is not information that is protected under section 552.117; thus, the district may not withhold this information, which we have marked for release, on that basis. The submitted information includes an election form demonstrating the former employee at issue timely elected to withhold his information. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the district must withhold the information you marked and we marked for withholding under section 552.117(a)(1); including the personal cellular telephone number if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body.

Section 552.119 of the Government Code provides as follows:

(a) A photograph that depicts a peace officer as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure, or a security officer commissioned under Section 51.212, Education Code, the release of which would endanger the life or physical safety of the officer, is excepted from [required public disclosure] unless:

- (1) the officer is under indictment or charged with an offense by information;
- (2) the officer is a party in a fire or police civil service hearing or a case in arbitration; or
- (3) the photograph is introduced as evidence in a judicial proceeding.

(b) A photograph exempt from disclosure under Subsection (a) may be made public only if the peace officer or security officer gives written consent to the disclosure.

Gov't Code § 552.119. Under section 552.119, a governmental body must demonstrate, if the documents do not demonstrate on their face, release of the photograph would endanger the life or physical safety of a peace officer. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate release of the submitted photograph would endanger an officer's life or physical safety. Accordingly, the district may not withhold the submitted photograph under section 552.119.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of Texas or another state or country is excepted from public release. *Id.* § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find some of the information you have marked does not consist of motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130; thus, the district may not withhold this information, which we have marked for release, on that basis. With the exception of the information we have marked for release, the district must withhold the information you have marked and we have marked for withholding under section 552.130.

Section 552.139 of the Government Code provides:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information that relates to computer network security, to restricted information under Section 2059.055 [of the Government Code], or to the design, operation, or defense of a computer network.

(b) The following information is confidential:

(1) a computer network vulnerability report; [and]

(2) any other assessment of the extent to which data processing operations, a computer, a computer program, network, system, or system interface, or software of a governmental body or of a contractor of a governmental body is vulnerable to unauthorized access or harm, including an assessment of the extent to which the governmental body's or contractor's electronically stored information containing sensitive or critical information is vulnerable to alteration, damage, erasure, or inappropriate use[.]

Id. § 552.139(a), (b)(1)-(2). Section 2059.055 of the Government Code provides in pertinent part:

(b) Network security information is confidential under this section if the information is:

- (1) related to passwords, personal identification numbers, access codes, encryption, or other components of the security system of a state agency;
- (2) collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental entity to prevent, detect, or investigate criminal activity; or
- (3) related to an assessment, made by or for a governmental entity or maintained by a governmental entity, of the vulnerability of a network to criminal activity.

Id. § 2059.055(b). You explain the employee identification numbers you have marked are unique personal identification numbers that, when used in conjunction with a password, provides access to district software program systems, including e-mail accounts, network information, and the system used by the district for tracking time worked and determining employees' pay. Accordingly, the district must withhold the employee identification numbers you have marked under section 552.139(a).⁵

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined an insurance policy number is an access device number for the purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009). The district must withhold the insurance policy number we have marked under section 552.136.

Section 552.152 of the Government Code provides:

Information in the custody of a governmental body that relates to an employee or officer of the governmental body is excepted from [required public disclosure] if, under the specific circumstances pertaining to the employee or officer, disclosure of the information would subject the employee or officer to a substantial threat of physical harm.

Gov't Code § 552.152. Upon our review, we find you have failed to demonstrate release of the information at issue would subject the officer at issue to a substantial threat of physical harm. Thus, the district may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.152.

In summary, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. The district must withhold the following information: (1) the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law; (2) the F-5 form we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code; (3) the information we marked under section 552.101 of the

⁵ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (4) the date of birth you marked and we marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code; (5) except for the information we marked for release, the information you marked and we marked for withholding under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code, including the personal cellular telephone number if the service is not paid for by a governmental body; (6) except for the information we marked for release, the information you have marked and we have marked for withholding under section 552.130 of the Government Code; (7) the employee identification numbers you have marked under section 552.139(a) of the Government Code; and (8) the insurance policy number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lindsay E. Hale
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LH/eb

Ref: ID# 791459

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)