



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 7, 2019

Mr. Oscar G. Gabaldon Jr.
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2019-28093

Dear Mr. Gabaldon:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 789720 (City's Reference# 19-1026-10594).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for the department's procedures manual. You state you will release most of the information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the internal records and notations of law enforcement agencies and prosecutors when their release would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(1); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 531 at 2 (1989) (quoting *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977)). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(b)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706. Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect "information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State." *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). This office has concluded section 552.108(b)(1) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.,* Open Records

Decision Nos. 531 (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.*, ORDs 531 at 2–3 (Penal Code provisions, common law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known).

The department argues release of the information at issue would enable the public, particularly criminals, to disrupt police operations, to take advantage of police restrictions, and to anticipate and thwart police responses and tactics. The department further argues the information at issue reveals certain techniques and procedures used by officers that, if released, would provide criminals with an advantage. Based on these representations and our review, we agree the release of some of the information at issue, which we have marked, would interfere with law enforcement. Accordingly, the department may withhold the information we marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.¹ However, we find the department has not demonstrated release of any of the remaining information at issue would interfere with law enforcement or crime prevention. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). We note section 552.108(a)(1) is generally not applicable to information that is purely administrative in nature and does not involve the investigation or prosecution of crime. *See City of Fort Worth*, 86 S.W.3d 320; *Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App. —El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 at 3-4 (1982). The department does not inform us the remaining information pertains to specific ongoing criminal investigations or prosecutions, nor has the department explained how its release would interfere in some way with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. Thus, we conclude the department has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.108(a)(1) to the remaining information. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we will not address the remaining argument of the department to withhold this information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Pearlie Gault", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Pearlie Gault
Attorney
Open Records Division

PG/eb

Ref: ID# 789720

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)