



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 16, 2019

Mr. Ryan Brooke
Assistant City Attorney
City of Lubbock
P.O. Box 2000
Lubbock, Texas 79457

OR2019-25910

Dear Mr. Brooke:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 785796 (File No. 2491).

The Lubbock Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified incident report involving a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

...

(2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code[.]

Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d)(2); *see also id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code).¹ Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Upon review, we agree the submitted information involves juvenile offenders, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). However, we note the requestor is a representative of the Colorado Bureau of Investigation (the “bureau”). Section 58.008(d)(2) of the Family Code gives a “criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code” a right of access to juvenile law enforcement records. *See id.* § 58.008(d)(2). Section 411.082 of the Government Code defines a “criminal justice agency” as including “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]” Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A). Thus, we find the requestor is requesting the information on behalf of a criminal justice agency as provided by section 58.008(d)(2) of the Family Code. Therefore, the requestor generally has a right of access to the submitted information under section 58.008(d)(2) and the department may not withhold the submitted information from this requestor under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. We also note a statutory right of access to the information prevails over common-law

¹Although you raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, we note the 85th Legislature repealed this provision effective September 1, 2017. Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 21, 2017 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3173, 3187. Thus, we understand you to raise section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

privacy. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S. W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Upon review, we find portions of the submitted information, which we have marked, consist of motor vehicle record information subject to section 552.130. Therefore, the department must generally withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130.

As previously noted, the requestor has a statutory right of access to the submitted information under section 58.008(d)(2) of the Family Code. A specific statutory right of access prevails over general exceptions to disclosure under the Act. However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Therefore, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 58.008(d)(2) and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) (“more specific statute controls over the more general”); *Cuellar*, 521 S.W.2d 277. In this instance, section 58.008(d)(2) generally applies to all juvenile law enforcement records, while section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. Thus, we find the confidentiality provided by section 552.130 is more specific than the general right of access provided by section 58.008(d)(2). Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code and must release the remaining information to this requestor.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open

²We note the information being released in this instance includes information that is confidential with respect to the general public. *See Fam. Code* §§ 58.008(d)(2). Therefore, if the department receives another request for this information from an individual other than this requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.

Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Tim Neal". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Tim" being more prominent than the last name "Neal".

Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/mo

Ref: ID# 785796

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)