



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 29, 2019

Mr. Joseph J. Gorfida
Counsel for the City of DeSoto
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P.
1800 Ross Tower
500 North Akard Street
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2019-24266

Dear Mr. Gorfida:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 784197 (ORR# 109009).

The City of DeSoto (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for a specified incident report. The city claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report.

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(h) This section does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under Chapter 42, Human Resources Code.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (h). The city states the information at issue was used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse. However, section 261.201 does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code. *Id.* § 261.201(h). The submitted information is related to an investigation of alleged abuse or neglect occurring in a child care facility that was regulated by the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code at the time of the incident in question. Therefore, we find section 261.201 is not applicable to the investigation at issue, and the city may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Video recording numbers PICT0003 and PICT0004 contain motor vehicle record information that is subject to section 552.130. The city states it lacks the technical capability to redact the information subject to section 552.130 from the video recordings. Based on this representation, we conclude the city must withhold video recording numbers PICT0003 and PICT0004 in their entireties under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, the remaining documents do not contain motor vehicle record information, and the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.130.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The requestor has a right of access to her child's date of birth pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Nevertheless, we agree the city must withhold the dates of birth it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the remaining information, including the


information in the remaining video recordings, does not satisfy the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. Accordingly, the remaining information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

In summary, the city must withhold video recording numbers PICT0003 and PICT0004 in their entireties under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must also withhold the dates of birth it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must release the remaining information.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/gw

Ref: ID# 784197

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

¹Because the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released, the city must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.