



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 28, 2019

Ms. Stacie S. White
Counsel for the City of Southlake
Taylor, Olson, Adkins, Sralla, Elam, L.L.P.
6000 Western Place, Suite 200
Fort Worth, Texas 76107

OR2019-24007

Dear Ms. White:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 783078.

The City of Southlake (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to individuals who have participated in activities of the Park and Recreation Department. The city states it will withhold information pursuant to sections 552.130(c) and 552.147(b) of the Government Code and Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).¹ The city claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.124 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See id.* § 552.147(b). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office.

common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note the submitted information does not contain dates of birth. Upon review, we find none of the submitted information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. Accordingly, the submitted information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy, which consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). Upon review, we find none of the submitted information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the submitted information is not confidential under constitutional privacy, and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.124 of the Government Code makes confidential "[a] record of a library or library system, supported in whole or in part by public funds, that identifies or serves to identify a person who requested, obtained, or used a library material or service[.]" Gov't Code § 552.124(a)-(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 100 at 3 (1975) (identifying information of library patrons in connection with object of their attentions is confidential by constitutional law). Upon review, we find the city has failed to demonstrate section 552.124 is applicable to the information at issue. Therefore, the city may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.124.

Section 552.148 of the Government Code is applicable to some of the submitted information.² Section 552.148 provides the following:

(a) In this section, "minor" means a person younger than 18 years of age.

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).

(b) The following information maintained by a municipality for purposes related to the participation by a minor in a recreational program or activity is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021:


- (1) the name, age, home address, home telephone number, or social security number of the minor;
- (2) a photograph of the minor; and
- (3) the name of the minor's parent or legal guardian.

Id. § 552.148. We understand the information at issue is a list of participants in municipal recreational programs or activities. Accordingly, the city must withhold the submitted names of minors and their parents or legal guardians, a representative sample of which we have marked, under section 552.148 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/mo

Ref: ID# 783078

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)