



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 28, 2019

Mr. Joseph J. Gorfida, Jr.  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Richardson  
P.O. Box 831078  
Richardson, Texas 75083-1078

OR2019-23988

Dear Mr. Gorfida:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 782994 (Reference No. P001865).

The Richardson Police Department (the "department") received a request for fourteen categories of information pertaining to a specified motor vehicle accident involving the requestor's client. You state the department released some information to the requestor, including the CR-3 accident report pursuant to section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065(c) (providing for the release of accident report to person or entity listed under this subsection). You also state the department is withholding dates of birth pursuant to the previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2017-00069 (2017).<sup>1</sup> You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, as you acknowledge, the submitted information includes peace officers' body worn camera recordings. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses

---

<sup>1</sup>Open Records Letter No. 2017-00069 is a previous determination issued to the department authorizing it to withhold the dates of birth of public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a decision from this office.

information made confidential by other statutes. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code provides the following:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor provided the information required by section 1701.661(a) for release of the body worn camera recordings at issue. The submitted body worn camera recordings reflect they were required to be made by law or the policies of the department and relate to a law enforcement purpose. *See id.* § 1701.661(h). We understand the recordings are or could be used as evidence in a criminal prosecution. *See id.* § 1701.661(d) (stating information “that is or could be used as evidence in a criminal prosecution is subject to the requirements of [the Act.]”). Additionally, we have no indication the recordings document incidents involving the use of deadly force by an officer or relate to an administrative or criminal investigation of an officer. *See id.* § 1701.660(a). The recordings demonstrate they were not made in a private space for the purposes of section 1701.661(f). *See id.* §§ 1701.661(f), .651(3) (defining “private space” for purposes of section 1701.661(f)). We note, however, section 1701.661(f) provides, in part:

A law enforcement agency may not release any portion . . . of a recording involving the investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and does not result in arrest, without written authorization from the person who is the subject of that portion of the recording or, if the person is deceased, from the person’s authorized representative.

*Id.* § 1701.661(f). You state the video recordings at issue consist of body worn camera recordings involving an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and which did not result in an arrest. We note there is no indication the department received written authorizations for release from all of the subjects of the recordings at issue. *See id.* Accordingly, we find the department must withhold the

submitted body worn camera recordings under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information, which we marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.<sup>3</sup>

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.”<sup>4</sup> Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 at 9 (2009). Accordingly, the department must withhold the insurance policy number we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.<sup>5</sup>

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

---

<sup>2</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

<sup>3</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

<sup>4</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

<sup>5</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

In summary, the department must withhold the submitted body worn camera recordings under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the insurance policy number we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.<sup>6</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James M. Graham  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JMG/be

Ref: ID# 782994

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>6</sup>We note the information being released contains information to which the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); ORD 481 at 4 (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Thus, if the department receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.