



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 20, 2019

Ms. Mary E. Miller
Assistant District Attorney
Denton County
127 North Woodrow Lane, Suite 300
Denton, Texas 76205

OR2019-23142

Dear Ms. Miller:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 781482.

The Denton County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to a specified death investigation.¹ You state the sheriff's office will release some information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the requestor has excluded the names of certain juveniles from his request for information. Therefore, such information is not responsive to this request. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request, and the sheriff's office is not required to release this information in response to this request.

Next, we note the information at issue includes law enforcement officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

¹We note the sheriff's office sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released.² However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of Texas or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov’t Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the remaining video recordings contain information that is confidential under section 552.130. You state the sheriff’s office does not have the technological capability to redact the motor vehicle record information from the recordings at issue. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the remaining video recordings in their entirety under section 552.130 of the Government Code.³ *See* Open Records Decision No. 364 (1983).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV,

²As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated any of the remaining responsive information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining responsive information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy.

In summary, as the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. The sheriff's office must withhold the remaining video recordings in their entirety under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the public citizen's date of birth we indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must release the remaining responsive information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kieran Hillis
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KH/gw

Ref: ID# 781482

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)