



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 14, 2019

Ms. Andrea D. Russell
Counsel for the Town of Flower Mound
Taylor Olson Adkins Sralla Elam, L. L. P.
6000 Western Place, Suite 200
Fort Worth, Texas 76107

OR2019-22528

Dear Ms. Russell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 780359.

The Town of Flower Mound (the "town"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified arrest. You state the town will release some information. You inform us the town will redact information pursuant to sections 552.130(c) and 552.147(b) of the Government Code and Open Records Decision 684 (2009).¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(b). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general opinion.

Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See id.* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter E-1 or subchapter F of the Government Code. *See Gov’t Code* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter E-1 or subchapter F of the Government Code. We note CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find some of the submitted information, which we have marked, consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Accordingly, the town must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. However, no portion of the remaining information constitutes CHRI for purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the town may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that basis.

You contend portions of the submitted information are confidential under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 724.018 of the Transportation Code, which provides, “[o]n the request of a person who has given a specimen at the request of a peace officer, full information concerning the analysis of the specimen shall be made available to the person or the person’s attorney.” Transp. Code § 724.018. We note statutory confidentiality under section 552.101 requires express language making information confidential or stating information shall not be released to the public. *See* Open Records Decision No. 478 at 2 (1987) (addressing statutory predecessor); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 658 at 4 (1998) (statutory confidentiality provision must be express, and confidentiality requirement will not be implied from statutory structure). No language in section 724.018 makes information encompassed by the statute confidential or prohibits the release of such information to the public. Thus, section 724.018 is not a statutory confidentiality provision. We, therefore, conclude the town may not withhold any portion of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 724.018.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (personal financial information includes choice of particular insurance carrier), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.).

Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the town must withhold the dates of birth of public citizens and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the town has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, the town may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We understand the town redacted motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code. However, we note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130. Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the town must withhold the information you marked and the additional motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the town must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The town must withhold the dates of birth of public citizens and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The town must withhold the information you marked and the additional motor vehicle record

information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The town must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kelly McWethy
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KSM/mo

Ref: ID# 780359

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)