



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 13, 2019

Lieutenant William Ryan
Police Department
City of Pharr
1900 South Cage Boulevard
Pharr, Texas 78577

OR2019-22411

Dear Lt. Ryan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 780266 (P000830-052819).

The City of Pharr (the "city") received a request for all records pertaining to an arrest of a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes court-filed documents that are subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a)(17) provides for the required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record" unless it is "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code, this is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). As such, section 552.108 does not make information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022 and the city may not withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) under section 552.108. We will, however, address your arguments under section 552.108 for the information that is not subject to section 552.022(a)(17).

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides, in pertinent part, the following:

- (a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

...

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

...

- (b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

(2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2), (b)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) or section 552.108(b)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the information at issue pertains to a criminal case that “has not resulted in a conviction or deferred adjudication.” We note sections 552.108(a)(2) and (b)(2) are applicable only if the information at issue is related to a concluded criminal case “that *did not* result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]” *See id.* § 552.108(a)(2), (b)(2) (emphasis added). Thus, we find you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of sections 552.108(a)(2) and (b)(2) to the information at issue, and the city may not withhold the information at issue on either of these bases.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”¹ *Id.* § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as laws that make criminal history record information (“CHRI”) confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (the “NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). *See generally* Gov’t Code §§ 411.081-.1409. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter E-1 or F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. However, the term CHRI does not include driving record information. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.082(2)(B). Accordingly, the city must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.192 of the Government Code, which governs the release of information maintained by DPS concerning the licensure of an individual to carry a concealed handgun. Section 411.192 provides, in relevant part:

(a) [DPS] shall disclose to a criminal justice agency information contained in its files and records regarding whether a named individual or any individual named in a specified list is licensed under this subchapter. Information on an individual subject to disclosure under this section includes the individual’s name, date of birth, gender, race, zip code, telephone number, e-mail address, and Internet website address. Except as otherwise provided by this section and by Section 411.193, all other records maintained under this subchapter are confidential and are not subject to mandatory disclosure under the [Act].

(b) An applicant or license holder may be furnished a copy of disclosable records regarding the applicant or license holder on request and the payment of a reasonable fee.

Id. § 411.192(a)-(b). The information we have marked consists of concealed handgun license information obtained from DPS. In this instance, the requestor is neither the license

holder nor a criminal justice agency. Thus, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.192.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 560.003 of the Government Code, which provides, “[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act].” *Id.* § 560.003; *see id.* § 560.001(1) (“biometric identifier” means retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry). There is no indication the requestor has a right of access to the submitted fingerprints under section 560.002. *See id.* § 560.002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual’s biometric identifier to another person unless the individual consents to disclosure). Accordingly, the city must withhold the fingerprints we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has found that personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally intimate or embarrassing. *See generally* Open Records Decision Nos. 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Additionally, the Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, we note common-law privacy is not applicable to information contained in public court records. *See Star-Telegram v. Walker*, 834 S.W.2d 54 (Tex. 1992).

Upon review, we find some the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Additionally, with the exception of the date of birth in the court-filed documents subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, the city must also withhold the public citizen’s date of birth in the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Some of the remaining information may be subject to section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Section 552.1175 protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. Gov't Code § 552.1175. Section 552.1175 applies, in part, to "peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure[.]" *Id.* § 552.1175(a)(1). Some of the remaining information, which we have marked, relates to an individual who may be a currently licensed peace officer and is not held by the city in an employment capacity. Accordingly, to the extent the individual at issue is currently licensed under article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure and elects to restrict access to his marked information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.1175.²

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Upon review, we find portions of the remaining information, including the submitted video recordings, consist of motor vehicle record information. Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked and the visible license plates and audible license plate numbers and driver's license numbers in the video recordings at issue, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the following: (1) the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code; (2) the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.192 of the Government Code; (3) the fingerprints we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code; (4) the information we marked and, with the exception of the date of birth in the court-filed documents subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, the public citizen's date of birth in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (5) the information we marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code to the extent the individual at issue is currently licensed under article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure and elects to restrict access to his marked information in accordance with section 552.1175(b); and (6) the motor vehicle record information we marked and the visible license plates and audible license plate numbers and driver's license numbers in the video recordings at issue, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

² Regardless of the applicability of section 552.1175 of the Government Code, we note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Pearlie Gault". The signature is written in a cursive style with a long horizontal stroke at the end.

Pearlie Gault
Attorney
Open Records Division

PMG/eb

Ref: ID# 780266

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)