



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 12, 2019

Mr. Vito Chavana
Assistant District Attorney
Hidalgo County Criminal District Attorney's Office
100 East Cano Street
Edinburg, Texas 78539

OR2019-22201

Dear Mr. Chavana:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 779897 (Ref. No. 2019-0074-SA.SO).

The Hidalgo County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to a named former employee. You state the sheriff's office will release some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

You claim Exhibit B is protected from disclosure by section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses former section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. We note the submitted information includes F-5 forms created prior to the effective date of the amendment of section 1701.454 by the Seventy-ninth Legislature. *See* Act of May 25, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 1298, § 4, 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 4094, 4096. Thus, the F-5 forms at issue are governed by the previous version of section 1701.454. *See*

Act of May 25, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 1298, § 6, 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 4094, 4096.¹
Former section 1701.454 provides as follows:

(a) A report or statement submitted to the commission under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act] unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

(b) Except as provided by this subsection, a commission member or other person may not release the contents of a report or statement submitted under this subchapter. The report or statement may be released only by the commission employee having the responsibility to maintain the report or statement and only if:

(1) the head of a law enforcement agency or the agency head's designee makes a written request on the agency's letterhead for the report or statement accompanied by the agency head's or designee's signature; and

(2) the person who is the subject of the report or statement authorizes the release by providing a sworn statement on a form supplied by the commission that includes the person's waiver of liability regarding an agency head who is responsible for or who takes action based on the report or statement.

Occ. Code § 1701.454 (repealed 2005). Upon review, we find the F-5 forms created prior to the effective date of the amendment of section 1701.454 are not subject to release under the provisions of former section 1701.454. Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the F-5 forms created prior to the effective date of the amendment of section 1701.454 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the current section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to TCOLE under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

¹Section 6 of the amending legislation states "[t]he changes in law made by this Act in relation to employment termination reports apply only to an employment termination report under Subchapter J, Chapter 1701, Occupations Code, regarding a resignation or termination that occurs on or after the effective date of this Act. An employment termination report regarding a resignation or termination that occurs before the effective date of this Act is governed by the law as it existed immediately before the effective date and that law is continued in effect for that purpose." Act of May 25, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 1298, § 6, 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 4094, 4096.

(a) All information submitted to the commission under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

(b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a commission member or other person may not release information submitted under this subchapter.

Id. § 1701.454. Upon review, we find the F-5 reports created after the effective date of the amendment of section 1701.454 do not indicate the peace officer at issue resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the remaining F-5 forms and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. Upon review, we find none of the remaining information is subject to section 1701.454, and the sheriff's office may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 412.0128 of the Labor Code, which provides "[i]nformation in or derived from a workers' compensation claim file regarding an employee . . . is confidential and is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may not be disclosed by the [State Office of Risk Management (the "SORM")] except as provided by Subsection (b), other provisions of this subchapter, or other law." Labor Code § 412.0128. We note the relevant language of section 412.0128 is substantially similar to section 402.083 of the Labor Code, which provides that "[i]nformation in or derived from a claim file regarding an employee is confidential and may not be disclosed by the [Division of Workers' Compensation of the Texas Department of Insurance (the "division")] except as provided by this subtitle or other law." *Id.* § 402.083(a). In Open Records Decision No. 533 (1989), this office construed the predecessor to section 402.083(a) to apply only to information the governmental body obtained from the Industrial Accident Board, subsequently the Texas Workers' Compensation Commission, and now the division. *See* Open Records Decision No. 533 at 3-6; *see also* Labor Code § 402.086 (transferring confidentiality conferred by section 402.083(a) of the Labor Code to information other parties obtain from division files). Accordingly, for purposes of section 402.083(a), information that was not obtained from the division may not be withheld on that basis. Based on this analysis, we find information in the possession of the sheriff's office that was not obtained from the SORM may not be withheld on the basis of section 412.0128 of the Labor Code. Although the sheriff's office asserts Exhibit E is confidential pursuant to section 412.0128, the sheriff's office provides no representation, and the documents do not reflect, the sheriff's office received these records from the SORM. Therefore, the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 412.0128 to Exhibit E. Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold Exhibit E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 421.0128 of the Labor Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 159.002 of the Occupations Code, which provides, in part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician and information obtained from those records. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find none of the information in Exhibit D constitutes medical records subject to section 159.002. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the information in Exhibit D under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). We understand you to assert the privacy analysis under section 552.102(a) is the same as the common-law privacy test under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). In *Hubert v. Harte-Hanks Texas Newspapers*, 652 S.W.2d 546 (Tex. App.—Austin 1983, writ ref'd n.r.e.), the Third Court of Appeals held the privacy test under section 552.102(a) is the same as the *Industrial Foundation* privacy test. However, the Texas Supreme Court expressly disagreed with *Hubert's* interpretation of section 552.102(a) and held its privacy standard differs from the *Industrial Foundation* test under section 552.101. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). The supreme court then considered the applicability of section 552.102 and held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Id.* at 347-48. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the former employee's date of birth we marked under section 552.102(a). However, we find no portion of the remaining information is subject to section 552.102(a) of the Government Code, and the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *See Indus. Found.*, 540

S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Upon review, we conclude some of the remaining information meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold Exhibit C and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. We note a post office box number is not a "home address" for purposes of section 552.117(a). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 at 4 (1994) (legislative history makes clear that purpose of Gov't Code § 552.117 is to protect public employees from being harassed at home). Upon review, we find no portion of the remaining information is subject to section 552.117(a)(2), and the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). As noted above a post office box number is not a "home address" for purposes of section 552.117(a). *See* ORD 622 at 4. Upon review, we find the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate any portion of the remaining information is subject to section 552.117(a), and the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.117 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. However, the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.130. Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the F-5 forms created prior to the effective date of the amendment of section 1701.454 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the remaining F-5 forms and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the former employee's date of birth we marked under section 552.102(a). The sheriff's office must withhold Exhibit C and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Kunst
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EK/be

Ref: ID# 779897

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)