



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 8, 2019

Mr. Austin R. Beck
Counsel for the City of Cibolo
Davidson, Troilo, Ream & Garza, P.C.
601 North West Loop 410, Suite 100
San Antonio, Texas 78216-5511

OR2019-21906

Dear Mr. Beck:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 779744.

The City of Cibolo (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for an incident report pertaining to a specified incident. The city claims the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information was the subject of a previous request for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2019-07733 (2019). In that ruling, we determined the city must (1) withhold all public citizens' dates of birth and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (2) withhold the motor vehicle record information, which we marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (3) release the remaining information. Section 552.007 of the Government Code provides if a governmental body voluntarily releases information to any member of the public, the governmental body may not withhold such information from further disclosure, unless its public release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential by law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision No. 518 at 3(1989); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 400 (1983) (governmental body may waive right to claim permissive exceptions to disclosure under the Act, but it may not disclose information made confidential by law). Accordingly,

pursuant to section 552.007, the city may not now withhold the previously released information, unless its release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential by law. We note sections 552.103 and 552.108 do not prohibit the release of information or make information confidential. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, the city may not now withhold information this office previously ordered to be released under section 552.103 or section 552.108. Further, the requestor, in this instance, has a right of access to some of the information at issue pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. Thus, we find the law, facts, and circumstances have changed since the issuance of the previous ruling, and the city may not rely on Open Records Letter No. 2019-07733 as a previous determination for the information at issue. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes information is or is not excepted from disclosure). We note some of the submitted information was created after the previous request was received. Thus, we will address your arguments for this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”¹ Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 261.201 of the Family Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k). We note portions of the submitted information were used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the city's police department. *See id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. In this instance, the requestor is a parent of the child victim listed in the information at issue. However, we note the requestor is alleged to have committed the suspected abuse or neglect. Thus, the requestor does not have a right of access to the information at issue under section 261.201(k). *See id.* § 261.201(k). Therefore, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note the requestor is one of the individuals whose privacy interest is at issue. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) ("person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open

Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Thus, the requestor has a right of access to information pertaining to herself that would otherwise be confidential under common-law privacy. Accordingly, with the exception of any information pertaining to the requestor, the city must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The city states the information not at issue in Open Records Letter No. 2019-07733 pertains to an active criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue. The city may withhold the information-at issue under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Accordingly, the requestor has a right of access to her own motor vehicle record information under section 552.023 of the Government Code and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.130. *See id.* § 552.023(a) ORD No. 481 at 4. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. With the exception of any information pertaining to the requestor, the city must withhold all public citizens’ dates of birth and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city may withhold the information not subject to Open Records Letter No. 2019-07733 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Pearlie Gault", with a large circular flourish in the middle.

Pearlie Gault
Attorney
Open Records Division

PG/eb

Ref: ID# 779744

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)