KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 1, 2019

Mr. Oscar G. Gabaldón, Jr.
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2019-21266

Dear Mr. Gabaldón:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 778293 (Ref. No. 19-1026-10456).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified address. You state the department will release some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code.[1] We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We note the submitted information includes a court-filed document. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record," unless it is "made confidential under [the Act] or other law[.]" Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). We have marked the document that is subject to section 552.022(a)(17). Although you seek to withhold this information under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code, these sections are discretionary exceptions and do not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; Open Records

[1]Although you also raise section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy and constitutional privacy for the submitted information, you provide no arguments explaining how these doctrines are applicable to the information at issue. Therefore, we assume you no longer assert these doctrines. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally); 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). As such sections 552.103 and 552.108 do not make information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022. Accordingly, the marked court document may not be withheld under section 552.103 or section 552.108. However, you also raise section 552.101, which makes information confidential under the Act. Therefore, we will address the applicability of section 552.101 to the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17). We will also address your arguments under sections 552.103 and 552.108 for the remaining information not subject to section 552.022.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by section 48.101 of the Human Resources Code, which pertains to the disclosure of reports of abuse, neglect, or exploitation of elderly and disabled persons in certain facilities. Section 48.101 provides, in pertinent part, as follows:

> (a) The following information is confidential and not subject to disclosure under [the Act]:
>
> > (1) a report of abuse, neglect, or exploitation made under this chapter;
> >
> > (2) the identity of the person making the report; and
> >
> > (3) except as provided by this section, all files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation made under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.
>
> (b) Confidential information may be disclosed only for a purpose consistent with this chapter and as provided by [the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services (the "DFPS")] or investigating state agency rule and applicable federal law.

Hum. Res. Code § 48.101(a), (b). Section 48.051 of the Human Resources Code provides "a person having cause to believe that an elderly person, a person with a disability, or an individual receiving services from a provider as described by Subsection F [of chapter 48 of the Human Resources Code] is in the state of abuse, neglect, or exploitation" shall report certain prescribed information to the DFPS or another appropriate state agency. *See id.* § 48.051(a). The only entities authorized to conduct an investigation under chapter 48 of the Human Resources Code are DFPS and certain other state agencies, depending on the circumstances surrounding the incident. *See id.* §§ 48.151, .152, .252, .301. Thus, reports the department creates generally are not subject to section 48.101. The department created

the information at issue in connection with a criminal investigation it conducted. The department has not demonstrated the Adult Protective Services division of DFPS ("APS") used or developed the information at issue in an APS investigation under chapter 48 of the Human Resources Code. *See id.* § 48.101(a)(3). Thus, the department has failed to demonstrate the information at issue pertains to an investigation conducted by an entity authorized to conduct such an investigation under chapter 48. Accordingly, the department may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 48.101 of the Human Resources Code.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). The department states the remaining information relates to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, which the department must release, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.[2]

In summary, the department must release the court filed document we marked pursuant to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. With the exception of basic information, which the department must release, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

---

[2]As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address the other arguments of the department to withhold the submitted information, except to note basic information may not be withheld from public disclosure under section 552.103. *See* Open Records Decision No. 597 at 2-3 (1991).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Britni Ramirez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BR/be

Ref: ID# 778293

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)