



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 15, 2019

Ms. Brittaney N. Davis
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
200 Texas Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2019-19085

Dear Ms. Davis:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 775108 (COFW PIR No. W084102).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual, including a specified arrest. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 58.008(b) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see also id.* §§ 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22, 2017 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3173, 3187. The juvenile must have been at least ten years old and less than seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We find the submitted information involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). The exceptions in section 58.008 do not appear to apply. Therefore, the submitted information is generally confidential under section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

We note the submitted information lists the named individual as a suspect who was older than seventeen at the time of the conduct. Although the requestor is a representative of the Federal Bureau of Investigation’s Criminal Justice Information Services Division (the “FBI”), she is seeking information about the adult offender and not a child offender identified in the submitted information. Thus, the requestor does not have a right of access to the submitted information under section 58.008(d) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.008(d) (“[l]aw enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code[.]”). However, section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”)] any criminal history record information [(“CHRI”)] maintained by [DPS] about a person.” *See* Gov’t Code § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code provides the following:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from [DPS CHRI] maintained by [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.*

§ 411.082(2). Thus, the submitted information contains CHRI of the named individual. However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of CHRI).

The FBI is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082, and we understand the requestor intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose. Although you also raise section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy for this information, we note a statutory right of access prevails over a claim under common-law privacy. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle); *see also CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Consequently, pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2), the city must generally make available to the requestor the CHRI pertaining to the named individual. Thus, there is a conflict between the confidentiality provided by section 58.008(b) of the Family Code and the requestor's right of access under section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Where information falls within both a general and a specific statutory provision, the specific provision prevails over the general statute. *See Gov't Code* § 311.026 (where general statutory provision conflicts with specific provision, specific provision prevails as exception to general provision unless the general provision is the later enactment and the manifest intent is that the general provision prevail); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). Although section 58.008(b) of the Family Code generally makes juvenile law enforcement records confidential, section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code gives specific types of requestors, criminal justice agencies, access to particular information, CHRI, for a criminal justice purpose. Thus, the statutory right of access granted to the requestor by section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code prevails over the more general confidentiality provision of section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. Therefore, notwithstanding section 58.008(b), the city must release the CHRI pertaining to the named individual pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "N. A. Ybarra". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a large, stylized "Y" and "A".

Nicholas A. Ybarra
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NAY/be

Ref: ID# 775108

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)