



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 11, 2019

Ms. Ann-Marie Sheely
Assistant County Attorney
Travis County
P.O. Box 1748
Austin, Texas 78767

OR2019-18764

Dear Ms. Sheely:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 774724.

The Travis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for a specified police report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

electronic means or otherwise from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

- (1) a juvenile justice agency, as defined by Section 58.101;
- (2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code;
- (3) the child; or
- (4) the child's parent or guardian.

(e) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record concerning the child under Subsection (d), the custodian of the record shall redact:

- (1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and
- (2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act] or any other law.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d), (e); *see id.* § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22, 2017 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3173, 3187. The juvenile must have

been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). The submitted information involves juvenile offenders, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). In this instance, however, the requestor is a parent or guardian of some of the juvenile offenders. Thus, the requestor has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning her children pursuant to section 58.008(d) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.008(d). Accordingly, the sheriff’s office may not withhold the submitted information from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. However, section 58.008(e)(1) provides any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the requestor’s child must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.008(e)(1). Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the personally identifiable information about juvenile suspects, offenders, victims, or witnesses who are not the requestor’s children, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. However, we find the sheriff’s office has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 58.008 of the Family Code to any portion of the remaining information, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis. Further, section 58.008(e)(2) provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See id.* § 58.008(e)(2). Thus, we will consider the applicability of sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code to the remaining information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note, however, an individual has a special right of access to private information concerning herself. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023(a), (b) (individual has special right of access to information that relates to himself and is protected by laws intended to protect his privacy interests, and governmental body may not deny access on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

himself). Thus, the requestor has a right of access to information pertaining to herself and her children that would otherwise be private. In this instance, the sheriff's office seeks to withhold some of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, some of the information the sheriff's office seeks to withhold on this basis relates to individuals who have been de-identified and whose privacy interest is thus protected. Thus, with the exception of the requestor and her children, the sheriff's office must withhold the dates of birth of identifiable public citizens under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. With the exception of the requestor and her children, the sheriff's office must withhold the dates of birth of identifiable public citizens under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information to this requestor.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

³We note the requestor has a right of access to the information at issue pursuant to section 58.008(d) of the Family Code. See Fam. Code § 58.008(d); see also Gov't Code § 552.023; ORD 481 at 4. If the sheriff's office receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the sheriff's office must again seek a ruling from this office. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kelly McWethy
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KSM/be

Ref: ID# 774724

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)