



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 10, 2019

Ms. Cynthia Trevino  
Counsel for the City of Live Oak  
Denton Navarro Rocha Bernal & Zech, P.C.  
2517 North Main Avenue  
San Antonio, Texas 78212-4685

OR2019-18729

Dear Ms. Trevino:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 782213 (ORR# PIA-19-154).

The Live Oak Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information related to incident number 1801-0735. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). Further, pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body must submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply

to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e). The department received the request for information on May 23, 2019. We understand the department was closed on May 27, 2019. The department does not inform us it was closed for any additional business days between May 23, 2019, and June 14, 2019. Accordingly, the department was required to provide the information required by section 552.301(b) by June 7, 2019. Moreover, the department was required to provide the information required by section 552.301(e) by June 14, 2019. However, the envelope in which the department provided the information required by sections 552.301(b) and 552.301(e) was postmarked June 17, 2019. *See id.* § 552.308(a)(1) (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Accordingly, we conclude the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). The department informs us the third parties may have protected proprietary interests in the submitted information. Accordingly, we will consider whether the submitted information may be withheld on behalf of the third parties. The department claims section 552.130 of the Government Code for the submitted information. Because section 552.130 can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address the department's argument under this exception against release of the submitted information. Further, section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness.<sup>1</sup> Therefore, we will address the applicability of section 552.101 to the submitted information. However, we find the department has failed to establish a compelling reason to address its remaining claimed exception.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus,

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code § 552.130.* Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CVMS/eb

Ref: ID# 782213

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)