



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 1, 2019

Ms. Bhavani Madiseti-Vemireddy  
Assistant County Attorney  
Williamson County Attorney's Office  
405 Martin Luther King Street, Number 7  
Georgetown, Texas 78626

OR2019-18029

Dear Ms. Madiseti-Vemireddy:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 773568.

Williamson County (the "county") received a request for all records pertaining to a specified incident involving a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also received and considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that interested party may submit written comments regarding why information should or should not be released).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. This section encompasses section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which is applicable to information relating to the provision of emergency medical services ("EMS"). Section 773.091 provides, in pertinent part:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation or treatment of a patient by [EMS] personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the [EMS] personnel or physician or maintained by an [EMS] provider are

confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b). However, section 773.091 further provides:

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving [EMS].

*Id.* § 773.091(g); *see id.* § 773.003(8) (defining “emergency medical services” for purposes of chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code). You claim Exhibit B consists of records made and maintained by emergency medical services personnel. Upon review, we find the information we marked constitutes EMS records made by EMS personnel or maintained by an EMS provider. Therefore, except for the information subject to section 773.091(g), which is not confidential under section 773.091, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code. However, we find the remaining information at issue does not consist of communications between certified emergency medical services personnel providing medical supervision and patients that were made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patients. *See id.* § 773.091 (a). Furthermore, the information at issue does not consist of records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of patients by emergency medical services personnel providing medical supervision that were created by the emergency medical services personnel or maintained by an emergency medical services provider. *See id.* § 773.091(b). Accordingly, we find section 773.091 does not apply to the remaining information, and the county may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual’s interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual’s autonomy within “zones of privacy” which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual’s privacy interests and the public’s need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the “most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). After review of the remaining information, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any portion of the remaining information falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual’s privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the county may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of constitutional privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, the right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death and the common-law right to privacy does not encompass information that relates only to a deceased individual. *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); *see also Justice v. Belo Broadcasting Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 147 (N.D. Tex. 1979) (“action for invasion of privacy can be maintained only by a living individual whose privacy is invaded” (quoting RESTATEMENT (SECOND) OF TORTS § 652I (1977))); Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (“the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death”). Accordingly, information pertaining to a deceased individual may not be withheld on common-law privacy grounds.

Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the county must withhold the information we marked, and all living public citizens' dates of birth, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the county has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the county may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by this state or another state or country.<sup>1</sup> Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We note the purpose of section 552.130 is to protect the privacy interests of individuals. Because the right of privacy lapses at death, a governmental body may not withhold motor vehicle record

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

information that pertains solely to deceased individuals under section 552.130. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229, H-917; ORD 272. Thus, the county may not withhold driver's license information that relates to a deceased individual. Accordingly, the county must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the county may withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code. The county must withhold the information we marked, and all living public citizens' dates of birth, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The county must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The county must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ashley Crutchfield  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

AC/be

Ref: ID# 773568

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)