



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 20, 2019

Ms. Yesica Antu-Sanchez
Records Management Officer
Bexar Appraisal District
P. O. Box 830248
San Antonio, Texas 78283-0248

OR2019-16834

Dear Ms. Antu-Sanchez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the “Act”), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 771581 (WO# 19-12656).

The Bexar Appraisal District (the “district”) received a request for information pertaining to the sales price of properties in a specified neighborhood and a specified zip code.¹ You claim the submitted information is exempted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.149 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 22.27 of the Tax Code, which states in pertinent part:

(a) Rendition statements, real and personal property reports, attachments to those statements and reports, and other information the owner of property provides to the appraisal office in connection with the appraisal of the property, including income and expense information related to a property filed with an appraisal office and information voluntarily disclosed to an

¹We note the district sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

appraisal office or the comptroller about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential, are confidential and not open to public inspection. The statements and reports and the information they contain about specific real or personal property or a specific real or personal property owner and information voluntarily disclosed to an appraisal office about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential may not be disclosed to anyone other than an employee of the appraisal office who appraises property except as authorized by Subsection (b) of this section.

Tax Code § 22.27(a). The district argues the submitted information is confidential under section 22.27(a). You state the district is an appraisal office for purposes of section 22.27. You state the information at issue “consists of documents generated using information obtained from property owners under a promise of confidentiality.” You do not indicate any of the exceptions in section 22.27(b) apply in this instance. *See id.* § 22.27(b). However, you do not inform us which portions of the information at issue were provided by property owners. Thus, we must rule conditionally. To the extent any of the information the district marked was provided by property owners in connection with an appraisal, the district must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 22.27 of the Tax Code. However, to the extent any of the information at issue was not provided by property owners in connection with an appraisal, the information is not confidential under section 22.27(a) of the Tax Code and the district may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

The district also claims section 552.149 of the Government Code for any remaining information it marked. Section 552.149 provides, in relevant part:

(a) Information relating to real property sales prices, descriptions, characteristics, and other related information received from a private entity by the comptroller or the chief appraiser of an appraisal district under Chapter 6, Tax Code, is excepted from the requirements of [the Act].

(b) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), the property owner or the owner’s agent may, on request, obtain from the chief appraiser of the applicable appraisal district a copy of each item of information described by Section 41.461(a)(2), Tax Code, and a copy of each item of information that the chief appraiser took into consideration but does not plan to introduce at the hearing on the protest. In addition, the property owner or agent may, on request, obtain from the chief appraiser comparable sales data from a reasonable number of sales that is relevant to any matter to be determined by the appraisal review board at the hearing on the property owner’s protest[.]

Gov’t Code § 552.149(a)-(b). Subsections 552.149(a) and (b) are limited to those counties having a population of 50,000 or more. *Id.* § 552.149(e). We note Bexar County has a population of 50,000 or more. You state any remaining information at issue “includes documents containing information relating to real property sales prices, descriptions,


characteristics, and other related information received from a private entity.” Therefore, we find to the extent any remaining information at issue relates to real property sales prices, descriptions, characteristics, and other related information that was provided to the district by private entities, it must be withheld under section 552.149(a) of the Government Code. Conversely, to the extent the remaining information does not relate to real property sales prices, descriptions, characteristics, and other related information or was not provided to the district by private entities, it is not confidential under section 552.149(a) and it may not be withheld on that basis.

In summary, to the extent any of the submitted information was provided by property owners in connection with an appraisal, the district must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 22.27 of the Tax Code. To the extent any remaining information relates to real property sales prices, descriptions, characteristics, and other related information that was provided to the district by private entities, it must be withheld under section 552.149(a) of the Government Code. The district must release any remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Matthew Taylor
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MHT/gw

Ref: ID# 771581

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)