



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 11, 2019

Ms. Tiffany Bull
Assistant City Attorney
City of Grand Prairie
P.O. Box 534045
Grand Prairie, Texas 75053-4045

OR2019-15669

Dear Ms. Bull:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 770013 (Ref. Nos. 19-0035, 19-0037, & 19-0041).

The Grand Prairie Police Department (the "department") received three requests from different requestors for information pertaining to a specified death investigation. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note the submitted information includes police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661 provides, in relevant part, the following:

¹This letter ruling assumes that the submitted representative sample of information is truly representative of the requested information as a whole. This ruling does not reach, and therefore does not authorize, the withholding of any other requested information to the extent that the other information is substantially different than that submitted to this office. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(e)(1)(D), .302; Open Records Decision Nos. 499 at 6 (1988), 497 at 4 (1988).

(a) A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). The first and second requests for information include requests for body worn camera recordings. In this instance, although the first and second requestors requested body worn camera recordings, neither requestor provides the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the body worn camera recordings at issue were not properly requested by the first and second requestors pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released to either requestor.² However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by [s]ubsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

²As we are able to make this determination, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness under 18 years of age unless that victim or witness is:

(A) the child who is the subject of the report; or

(B) another child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information; [and]

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(1)-(2). The remaining information was used or developed in an investigation conducted under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201(a). *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. The department states it has not adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information.

We note the third requestor is a representative of the United States Consumer Product Safety Commission (the “commission”). Section 261.201 provides information encompassed by subsection (a) may only be released to certain persons and entities under limited circumstances. *See id.* § 261.201(a). The third requestor has not demonstrated the commission falls within any category of persons or entities that are authorized to receive information made confidential by section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201 (b)-(g) (listing entities authorized to receive information made confidential by section 261.201(a)). Additionally, although the commission generally claims it is authorized to collect law enforcement records from state officials pursuant to section 2078 of title 15 of the United States Code, the third requestor has not explained, and we are not otherwise able to discern,

how this provision grants the commission a right of access that preempts the confidentiality of section 261.201 of the Family Code. Therefore, we conclude the department must withhold the remaining information from the first and third requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

However, the second requestor represents a parent of the child victim listed in the information, and the parent is not alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect. Thus, pursuant to section 261.201(k), the information at issue may not be withheld from the second requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(1) states any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness who is under 18 years of age and is not the child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information shall be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(1). Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(l)(1) of the Family Code. Further, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information we have indicated satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.³ *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

In summary, as the body worn camera recordings at issue were not properly requested by the first and second requestors pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released to either requestor. The department must withhold the remaining information from the first and third requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. With respect to the second requestor, the department must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(1) of the Family Code; must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and must release the remaining dashboard camera recordings and photographs.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Michelle Garza
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MG/gw

Ref: ID# 770013

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 3 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)