



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 11, 2019

Mr. James Kopp
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P O Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78207

OR2019-15636

Dear Mr. Kopp:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 777548 (ORR# W264721).

The City of San Antonio (the "city") received a request for records related to two specified incidents. The city claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the city claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code is applicable to emergency 9-1-1 districts established in accordance with chapter 772. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). This section makes the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier confidential. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.218 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 1.5 million. The city states it is part of an emergency communication district established under

section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code. Upon review, we conclude the city must withhold the telephone number it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code if the information consists of the originating telephone number furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. If the marked information does not consist of the originating telephone number provided by a 9-1-1 service supplier, it may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 772.218.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information, which we have marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the city has not demonstrated any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the city may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the city must withhold the telephone number it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code if the numbers consist of the originating telephone numbers furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. The city must withhold the information we marked, as well as all public citizens' dates of birth, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Jesse Harvey", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Jesse Harvey
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JH/eb

Ref: ID# 777548

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)