



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 17, 2019

Ms. Sara Casares  
Office Specialist  
Edinburg Police Department  
1702 South Closner Boulevard  
Edinburg, Texas 78539

OR2019-13276

Dear Ms. Casares:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 765984.

The Edinburg Police Department (the "department") received a request for all police and court records pertaining to a specified case, including the evidence box. You claim portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the requestor seeks the evidence box pertaining to the specified case. The Act applies to "public information," which is defined in section 552.002 of the Government Code. Section 552.002 provides, in pertinent part, the following:

(a) In this chapter, "public information" means information that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:
  - (A) owns the information;
  - (B) has a right of access to the information; or

(C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or

(3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). This office has ruled tangible physical items are not "information," as that term is contemplated under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990). Thus, the evidence box is not public information for purposes of section 552.002 of the Government Code, and the Act does not require the department to make the evidence box available to the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.021.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" *Id.* § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You represent the information you marked relates to an open criminal investigation, and release of this information would interfere with the investigation of the case. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information you marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes, among other items, a sufficient portion of the narrative to include a detailed description of the offense. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Accordingly, we determine the department must release a sufficient portion of the narrative to encompass a detailed description of the offense to satisfy the required release of basic information pursuant to *Houston Chronicle*. Accordingly, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note the right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death and the common-law right to privacy does not encompass information that relates only to a deceased individual. *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also Justice v. Belo Broadcasting Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 147 (N.D. Tex. 1979) (“action for invasion of privacy can be maintained only by a living individual whose privacy is invaded” (quoting RESTATEMENT (SECOND) OF TORTS § 652I (1977))); Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (“the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death”). Thus, information pertaining to a deceased individual may not be withheld on common-law privacy grounds. We note you have marked information pertaining to a deceased individual. Accordingly, the department must withhold all living public citizens’ dates of birth within the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See Gov’t Code § 552.130*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the social security number of a living person. *See Gov’t Code § 552.147*. We note you have marked the social security number of a deceased individual. Thus, this information may not be withheld under section 552.147. Accordingly, we agree the department may withhold the social security numbers of living individuals within the remaining information under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold all living public citizens’ dates of birth within the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle

record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department may withhold the social security numbers of living individuals within the remaining information under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James M. Graham  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JMG/gw

Ref: ID# 765984

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)