



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 13, 2019

Mr. Alexander Garcia
Assistant City Attorney
City of Corpus Christi
P.O. Box 9277
Corpus Christi, Texas 78469-9277

OR2019-12763

Dear Mr. Garcia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 765128 (ORR# MSa11).

The Corpus Christi Police Department (the "department") received a request for all records related to two named individuals. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.152 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in

courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf.* Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). Further, active warrant information or other information relating to an individual's current involvement in the criminal justice system does not constitute criminal history information for the purposes of section 552.101. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system).

The present request seeks all reports pertaining to either of two named individuals. This request requires the department to compile the named individuals' criminal histories and implicates each named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records listing either named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must generally withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note the department has submitted information that does not list either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individuals' criminal histories, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy on that basis. Accordingly, we will address the applicability of other exceptions to disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Report numbers 0808090132, 1805100105, 1807030091, 93-032107, 1803280144, 1803280146, 06-014973, and 02-014845 were used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. The department does not indicate it has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information and therefore we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must generally withhold report numbers 0808090132, 1805100105, 1807030091, 93-032107, 1803280144, 1803280146, 06-014973, and 02-014845 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see also id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Report number 1806020085 involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.008 apply. Accordingly, the department must generally withhold report number 1806020085 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

However, the requestor is a representative of the Corpus Christi Housing Authority. Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) of title 42 of the United States Code, the federal Housing Opportunity Program Extension Act of 1996, provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law, . . . the National Crime Information Center, police departments, and other law enforcement agencies shall, upon request, provide information to public housing agencies regarding the criminal conviction records of adult applicants for, or tenants of, covered housing assistance for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction.” 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Section 1437d(q)(1)(C) provides, “[a] law enforcement agency described in subparagraph (A) shall provide information under this paragraph relating to any criminal conviction of a juvenile only to the extent that the release of such information is authorized under the law of the applicable State, tribe, or locality.” *Id.* § 1437d(q)(1)(C). In Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997), this office concluded a local housing authority is a noncriminal justice agency authorized by federal statute to receive criminal history record information (“CHRI”). ORD 655 at 4. CHRI consists of “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). The Department of Public Safety (the “DPS”) is required to provide CHRI to a noncriminal justice agency authorized to receive CHRI pursuant to a federal statute, executive order, or state statute. *Id.* § 411.083(b)(2). Nevertheless, the federal law limits the purposes for which a public housing authority may request CHRI. The federal law provides, among other things, CHRI may only be used for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, and eviction. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A); ORD 655 at 3-5. Section 1437d(q)(1)(A) states a housing authority shall be provided access to the CHRI “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law[.]” 42 U.S.C. § 1437d(q)(1)(A). Based on this language, we find section 1437d(q)(1)(A) prevails over sections 58.008 and 261.201 of the Family Code and over the common law. *Cf. Equal Employment Opportunity Comm’n v. City of Orange, Texas*, 905 F. Supp. 381, 382 (E.D. Tex. 1995) (federal law prevails over inconsistent provision of state law); *Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S. W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law).

The requestor does not indicate whether the requested information will be used for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction. Accordingly, we must rule in the alternative. To the extent the requestor will use the requested information for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, the department must release any CHRI of applicants or tenants of public housing within the information at issue in accordance with section 1437d(q)(1) of chapter 42 of the United States Code. *See also* 24 C.F.R. § 5.903 (describing public housing authorities’ access to criminal records). However, to the extent the requestor will not use the requested information for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, the department must not release CHRI.

The department argues some of the remaining information at issue is protected under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we agree the information the department marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.152 of the Government Code provides,

Information in the custody of a governmental body that relates to an employee or officer of the governmental body is excepted from [required public disclosure] if, under the specific circumstances pertaining to the employee or officer, disclosure of the information would subject the employee or officer to a substantial threat of physical harm.

Gov't Code § 552.152. Upon review, we find the department has not demonstrated the release of any of the remaining information would subject an employee of the department to a substantial threat of physical harm. Thus, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.152 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records listing either named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must generally withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must also generally withhold report numbers 0808090132, 1805100105, 1807030091, 93-032107, 1803280144, 1803280146, 06-014973, and 02-014845 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code and must generally withhold report number 1806020085 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. However, to the extent the requestor will use the requested information for purposes of applicant screening, lease enforcement, or eviction, the department must release any CHRI

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

of applicants or tenants of public housing within the information at issue in accordance with section 1437d(q)(1) of chapter 42 of the United States Code. The department must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

The department also asks this office to issue a previous determination that would permit it to withhold information under section 552.152 of the Government Code without requesting a ruling from this office. Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001). We decline to issue such a previous determination at this time. Accordingly, this letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/mo

Ref: ID# 765128

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)