



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 7, 2019

Mr. Eric C. Farrar  
Counsel for the City of Memorial Villages  
Olson & Olson LLP  
Wortham Tower  
2727 Allen Parkway, Suite 600  
Houston, Texas 77019-2133

OR2019-12200

Dear Mr. Farrar:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID#764131 (Reference Nos. MVPD19-001 and MVPD19-002).

The Memorial Villages Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received two requests from the same requestor for specified information related to a specified incident. You state you released some of the information. You state the department will redact certain information pursuant to sections 552.130(c) and 552.147(b) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report.

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(h) This section does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under Chapter 42, Human Resources Code.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (h). You state the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse or neglect. However, section 261.201 does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code. *Id.* § 261.201(h). The submitted information relates to an investigation of alleged abuse or neglect occurring in a child care facility that was regulated by the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code at the time of the incident in question. Therefore, we find section 261.201 is not applicable to the investigation at issue, and the department may not

---

<sup>2</sup>We assume the “representative sample” of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). This office has also held common-law privacy protects the identifying information of juvenile victims of abuse or neglect. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 261.201. We note some of the information at issue pertains to the minor child of the requestor's client. The requestor has a right of access to this information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023 (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Upon review, we conclude some of the submitted information meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. You state the submitted video recording contains identifying information of child victims and witnesses who are not the client's child. You further state the department does not possess the technological capability to redact information from the submitted video recording. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you marked, the photographs you indicated, and the submitted video recording in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

---

<sup>3</sup>Because the requestor has a right of access to some of the information, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives a request for this information from a different requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Emily Buchanan". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke at the end.

Emily Buchanan  
Attorney  
Open Records Division

EB/mo

Ref: ID# 764131

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)