



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 6, 2019

Ms. Ellen H. Spalding
Counsel for the Klein Independent School District
Karczewski, Bradshaw, Spalding, Nichols, Lamp & Langlois
3700 Buffalo Speedway, Suite 560
Houston, Texas 77098

OR2019-12006

Dear Ms. Spalding:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 763853.

The Klein Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for information related to a specified car crash. The district claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions the district claims and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

Some of the submitted information is subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is

¹Although the district does not raise section 552.130 of the Government Code in its brief, we understand the district to raise this exception based on its markings.

²We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

In this instance, the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Although the district asserts section 552.103 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.103 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the district may not withhold the information under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

The district also asserts section 552.130 of the Government Code for the motor vehicle record information contained in the accident report. As noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See, e.g.*, ORDs 613 at 4, 451. However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the confidentiality provided under section 552.130 of the Government Code and the right of access provided under section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code for the accident report. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 211 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones); Open Records Decision Nos. 598 (1991), 583 (1990), 451. Section 550.065(c) specifically provides access only to accident reports of the type at issue, while section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context. Thus, we conclude the access to the accident report provided under section 550.065(c) is more specific than the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Accordingly, the district may not withhold any portion of the CR-3 accident report under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Therefore, the district must release the accident report in its entirety to this requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides in relevant part as follows:

- (a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a).

The question of whether litigation is reasonably anticipated must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *See* Open Records Decision No. 452 at 4 (1986). To establish litigation is reasonably anticipated, a governmental body must provide this office “concrete evidence showing that the claim that litigation may ensue is more than mere conjecture.” *Id.* In Open Records Decision No. 638 (1996), this office stated a governmental body has met its burden of showing litigation is reasonably anticipated by representing it received a notice-of-claim letter that is in compliance with the Texas Tort Claims Act (“TTCA”), chapter 101 of the Civil Practices and Remedies Code. If that representation is not made, the receipt of the claim letter is a factor we will consider in determining, from the totality of the circumstances presented, whether the governmental body has established litigation is reasonably anticipated. *See* ORD 638 at 4.

The district informs us, and provides documentation demonstrating, prior to the date it received the instant request for information, the district received a letter of representation from the requestor. The district informs us the requestor is an attorney whose client was injured as a result of the specified car crash, which also involved an officer of the district's police department. The district explains the requestor's letter of representation sought preservation of evidence and contained a threat to file litigation. The district does not affirmatively represent to this office the claim letter is in compliance with the TTCA. Therefore, we will only consider the claim as a factor in determining whether the district reasonably anticipated litigation when it received the request for information. Based on the representations of the district, our review of the submitted documents, and the totality of circumstances, we find the district has demonstrated the district reasonably anticipated litigation when it received the request for information. We also find the district has established the information is related to the anticipated litigation for purposes of section

552.103(a). Therefore, the district may withhold the remaining information under section 552.103(a) of the Government Code.

However, once the information has been obtained by all parties to the anticipated litigation, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. Open Records Decision No. 349 at 2 (1982). We also note the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends when the litigation has concluded. Attorney General Opinion MW-575 at 2 (1982); Open Records Decision Nos. 350 at 3 (1982), 349 at 2.

In summary, the district must release the accident report in its entirety to this requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. The district may withhold the remaining information under section 552.103(a) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/jxd

Ref: ID# 763853

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)