



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 1, 2019

Lieutenant Russell Brown
Records Manager
City of Bellaire Police Department
5110 Jessamine Street
Bellaire, Texas 77401-4411

OR2019-11582

Dear Lieutenant Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 763271 (Department# OR 19-06).

The Bellaire Police Department (the "department") received a request for eleven categories of information related to ongoing criminal and civil litigation. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have also received and considered comments from the requestor. *See Gov't Code § 552.304* (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should or should not be released). We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information, which we have indicated, is not responsive to the instant request for information because it was created after the request for information was received. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and the department is not required to release non-responsive information in response to this request.¹

¹As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Next, we note a portion of the submitted information consists of police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released.² However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information you indicated relates to a pending criminal investigation and prosecution. Based on your representation and our review, we find release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information you indicated.

²As we are able to make this determination, we need not address the argument against disclosure of this information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes, among other items, a detailed description of the offense. See ORD 127 at 3-4. In this instance, the department has indicated the entire narrative portion of the submitted incident report as information it seeks to withhold under section 552.108. The remaining information at issue does not contain information sufficient to satisfy the requirement that a "detailed description of the offense" be released as basic information. See *id.* Accordingly, we determine the department must release a sufficient portion of the narrative to encompass a detailed description of the offense. Thus, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information you indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."⁴ Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the department must withhold the date of birth in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, as the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. With the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information you indicated under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the date of birth in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure, except to note basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).

⁴The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kelly McWethy
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KSM/jxd

Ref: ID# 763271

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)