



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 29, 2019

Mr. Thomas McMillian
Assistant City Attorney
City of Amarillo
200 Southeast Third Avenue, 4th Floor
Amarillo, Texas 79101-1514

OR2019-11313

Dear Mr. McMillian:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 762229 (Ref. Nos. 18-3159 & 18-3161).

The Amarillo Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for information pertaining to a specified accident. We understand the department has redacted visible license plates pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

¹We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

²We note the department failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code with regard to the requests at issue; however, sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to withhold information sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness caused by a failure to comply with section 552.301. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302. We note the Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception, such as section 552.130, on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987). Accordingly, we will consider the applicability of sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code to the submitted information.

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness under 18 years of age unless that victim or witness is:

(A) the child who is the subject of the report; or

(B) another child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information;

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law; and

(3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l). The submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect by the department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age

who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. We note the requestor is the legal representative of one of the child victims who is the subject of the report. Thus, pursuant to section 261.201(k), the submitted information may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(1) states any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness who is under 18 years of age and is not the child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information shall be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(1). Accordingly, the department must withhold the personally identifiable information about victims or witnesses who are under 18 years of age other than the child represented by the requestor, which we have indicated, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(l)(1) of the Family Code. Moreover, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, we note the information at issue includes the date of birth of an individual who will be de-identified and whose privacy interest will, thus, be protected. Further, the requestor has a right of access pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code to her client’s date of birth. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.023(a) (“person’s authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests”); ORD 481 at 4. Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, with the exception of the date of birth of the requestor’s client, the department must withhold the dates of birth of all identified public citizens and the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.


Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov’t Code* § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and all visible registration stickers in the submitted photographs under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the personally identifiable information about victims or witnesses who are under 18 years of age other than the child represented by the requestor, which we have indicated, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(1) of the Family Code. With the exception of the date of birth of the requestor's client, the department must withhold the dates of birth of all identified public citizens and the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and all visible registration stickers in the submitted photographs under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Michelle Garza
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MG/gw

Ref: ID# 762229

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³The information being released contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b). In addition, we note the requestor has a right of access to the information being released in this instance. If the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office. *See id.* §§ 552.301, .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).