



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 17, 2019

Ms. Anastasia Broadfoot  
Attorney, Office of the General Counsel  
Texas Alcoholic Beverage Commission  
P.O. Box 13127  
Austin, Texas 78711-3137

OR2019-10293

Dear Ms. Broadfoot:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 759969 (ORR Nos.: R000602-012519 and R000797-030519).

The Texas Alcoholic Beverage Commission (the "commission") received two requests from different requestors for information pertaining to a specified company for a certain period of time.<sup>1</sup> You state you will release some information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.107, 552.108, and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."

---

<sup>1</sup>We note the commission sought and received clarification of the information requested pertaining to the first request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding when governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification of unclear or overbroad request for public information, ten-business-day period to request attorney general opinion is measured from date request is clarified or narrowed).

<sup>2</sup>We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Section 5.48 of the Alcoholic Beverage Code provides as follows:

(a) "Private records," as used in this section, means all records of a permittee, licensee, or other person other than the name, proposed location, and type of permit or license sought in an application for an original or renewal permit or license, or in a periodic report relating to the importation, distribution, or sale of alcoholic beverages required by the commission to be regularly filed by a permittee or licensee.

(b) The private records of a permittee, licensee, or other person that are required or obtained by the commission or its agents, in connection with an investigation or otherwise, are privileged unless introduced in evidence in a hearing before the commission or before a court in this state or the United States.

Alco. Bev. Code § 5.48. The term "privileged" in this statute has been construed to mean "confidential" for purposes of the Act. Attorney General Opinion JM-1235 at 2 (1990); Open Records Decision Nos. 186 (1978), 62 (1974). Thus, section 5.48 makes confidential any records required or obtained by the commission, with the exception of "the name, proposed location, and type of permit or license sought in an application for an original or renewal permit or license" and "a periodic report relating to the importation, distribution, or sale of alcoholic beverages required by the commission to be regularly filed by a permittee or licensee." Alco. Bev. Code § 5.48.

You explain Exhibit D consists of application and renewal records for commission licenses or permits and internal communications related to these application records. You state none of the information at issue has been introduced as evidence in a hearing before the commission or before a court in Texas or the United States. Based upon these representations and our review, we agree the information at issue constitutes private records under section 5.48 of the Alcoholic Beverage Code. Accordingly, with the exception of the name, proposed location, and type of permit sought in the relevant applications, which you state the commission will release, the commission must withhold Exhibit D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 5.48 of the Alcoholic Beverage Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The commission states Exhibit C pertains to active criminal investigations conducted by its enforcement division. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would

interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which you state you will release, the commission may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup>

In summary, with the exception of the name, proposed location, and type of permit sought in the relevant applications, which you state the commission will release, the commission must withhold Exhibit D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 5.48 of the Alcoholic Beverage Code. With the exception of basic information, which you state you will release, the commission may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



D. Michelle Case  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

DMC/jxd

---

<sup>3</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Ref: ID# 759969

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors  
(w/o enclosures)