



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 12, 2019

Mr. Brian Sears
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Public Safety
P.O. Box 4087
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2019-09921

Dear Mr. Sears:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 763030 (PIR# 19-0716).

The Texas Department of Public Safety (the "department") received a request for communications pertaining to specified topics. You state you have no information responsive to a portion of the request.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.152 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a press release. Section 552.007 of the Government Code provides information that has been voluntarily released to a member of the public may not subsequently be withheld from another member of the public, unless public disclosure of the information is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential under law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 518 at 3 (1989), 490 at 2 (1988). Accordingly, the department may not withhold previously released information unless its release is expressly prohibited by law or the information is confidential

¹The Act does not require a governmental body that receives a request for information to create information that did not exist when the request was received. *See Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 563 at 8 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

under law. Although the department seeks to withhold the previously released information under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the department may not withhold the press release, which we marked, under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.152 of the Government Code can make information confidential for the purposes of section 552.007, we will consider the department's arguments under these sections for the press release.

Section 552.108(b) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a]n internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution . . . if: (1) release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution[.]” Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(1). This section is intended to protect “information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State.” *City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). This office has concluded this provision protects certain kinds of information, the disclosure of which might compromise the security or operations of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 at 3-4 (1989) (detailed guidelines regarding police department's use of force policy), 508 at 3-4 (1988) (information relating to future transfers of prisoners), 413 (1984) (sketch showing security measures for forthcoming execution). However, to claim this aspect of section 552.108 protection a governmental body must meet its burden of explaining how and why release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. Open Records Decision No. 562 at 10 (1990). Further, commonly known policies and techniques may not be withheld under section 552.108. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 at 2-3 (former section 552.108 does not protect Penal Code provisions, common-law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force), 252 at 3 (1980) (governmental body did not meet burden because it did not indicate why investigative procedures and techniques submitted were any different from those commonly known with law enforcement and crime prevention). To prevail on its claim that section 552.108(b)(1) excepts information from disclosure, a law-enforcement agency must do more than merely make a conclusory assertion that releasing the information would interfere with law enforcement. The determination of whether the release of particular records would interfere with law enforcement is made on a case-by-case basis. Open Records Decision No. 409 at 2 (1984).

You explain the information at issue pertains to joint operations between the department and local law enforcement agencies. You state the information at issue reveals “details of staffing and equipment utilized for these operations[.]” You further argue release of the information at issue “would provide wrong-doers, drug traffickers, terrorists, and other

criminals with invaluable information concerning the law enforcement efforts [at issue], allowing these groups to identify vulnerabilities and avoid detection.” Upon review, we find you have established release of some of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. Therefore, with the exception of the information we marked for release and the information we marked pursuant to section 552.007, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.² However, we find you have not demonstrated release of the remaining information at issue would interfere with law enforcement or crime prevention. Accordingly, the department may not withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.108(b)(1).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes. As part of the Texas Homeland Security Act, sections 418.176 through 418.182 were added to chapter 418 of the Government Code. These provisions make confidential certain information related to terrorism. Section 418.176 of the Homeland Security Act provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is confidential if the information is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental entity for the purpose of preventing, detecting, responding to, or investigating an act of terrorism or related criminal activity and:

(1) relates to the staffing requirements of an emergency response provider, including a law enforcement agency, a fire-fighting agency, or an emergency services agency;

(2) relates to a tactical plan of the provider[.]

Id. § 418.176(a)(1), (2). Section 418.177 provides that information is confidential if it:

(1) is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental entity for the purpose of preventing, detecting, or investigating an act of terrorism or related criminal activity; and

(2) relates to an assessment by or for a governmental entity, or an assessment that is maintained by a governmental entity, of the risk or vulnerability of persons or property, including critical infrastructure, to an act of terrorism or related criminal activity.

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Id. § 418.177. The fact that information may relate to a governmental body's security concerns does not make the information *per se* confidential under the Texas Homeland Security Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). Furthermore, the mere recitation by a governmental body of a statute's key terms is not sufficient to demonstrate the applicability of a claimed provision. As with any exception to disclosure, a governmental body asserting one of the confidentiality provisions of the Texas Homeland Security Act must adequately explain how the responsive records fall within the scope of the claimed provision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies). Upon review, we find the department has failed to demonstrate the remaining information is confidential under section 418.176 or section 418.177 of the Government Code. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.176 or section 418.177 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law physical safety exception. For many years, this office determined section 552.101, in conjunction with the common-law right to privacy, protected information from disclosure when "special circumstances" exist in which the disclosure of information would place an individual in imminent danger of physical harm. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 169 (1977) (special circumstances required to protect information must be more than mere desire for privacy or generalized fear of harassment or retribution), 123 (1976) (information protected by common-law right of privacy if disclosure presents tangible physical danger). However, the Texas Supreme Court has held freedom from physical harm does not fall under the common-law right to privacy. *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Cox Tex. Newspapers, LP. & Hearst Newspapers, LLC*, 343 S.W.3d 112 (Tex. 2011) (holding "freedom from physical harm is an independent interest protected under law, untethered to the right of privacy"). Instead, in *Cox*, the court recognized, for the first time, a separate common-law physical safety exception to required disclosure that exists independent of the common-law right to privacy. *Id.* at 118. Pursuant to this common-law physical safety exception, "information may be withheld [from public release] if disclosure would create a substantial threat of physical harm." *Id.* In applying this new standard, the court noted "deference must be afforded" law enforcement experts regarding the probability of harm, but further cautioned that "vague assertions of risk will not carry the day." *Id.* at 119. Upon review, we find you failed to demonstrate disclosure of the remaining information would create a substantial threat of physical harm to an individual. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the common-law physical safety exception.

Section 552.152 of the Government Code provides,

Information in the custody of a governmental body that relates to an employee or officer of the governmental body is excepted from [required

public disclosure] if, under the specific circumstances pertaining to the employee or officer, disclosure of the information would subject the employee or officer to a substantial threat of physical harm.

Gov't Code § 552.152. You generally raise section 552.152 of the Government Code for the remaining information. Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate the release of the remaining information would subject an employee or officer to a substantial risk of physical harm. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.152 of the Government Code.

We note some of the remaining information may be subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code.³ Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code exempts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. We note section 552.117 also encompasses a personal cellular telephone number, unless the cellular service is paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the department may only withhold the marked cellular telephone number if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body.

In summary, with the exception of the information we marked for release and the information we marked pursuant to section 552.007 of the Government Code, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the department may only withhold the marked cellular telephone number if the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. The department must release the remaining information we marked for release and the information we marked pursuant to section 552.007 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Meagan J. Conway
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MC/jxd

Ref: ID# 763030

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)