



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 10, 2019

Mr. Albert DiMarco
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Public Safety
P.O. Box 4087
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2019-09643

Dear Mr. DiMarco:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 758856 (PIR# 19-0361).

The Texas Department of Public Safety (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident involving the requestor. You state the department has released some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes a police officer's body worn camera recording. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and

- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recording pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Next, we note some of the submitted information is subject to article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Article 2.1396 provides as follows:

A person stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under Section 49.04, 49.045, 49.07, or 49.08, Penal Code, is entitled to receive from a law enforcement agency employing the peace officer who made the stop or arrest a copy of any video made by or at the direction of the officer that contains footage of:

- (1) the stop;
- (2) the arrest;
- (3) the conduct of the person stopped during any interaction with the officer, including during the administration of a field sobriety test; or
- (4) a procedure in which a specimen of the person’s breath or blood is taken.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.1396. Some of the submitted information consists of video recordings made by or at the direction of officers employed by the department that contain footage of the requestor being stopped or arrested or the conduct of the requestor, or a procedure in which a specimen of the requestor’s blood or breath is taken on suspicion of an offense under section 49.04 of the Penal Code. Penal Code § 49.04 (person commits offense if person is intoxicated while operating motor vehicle in public place). Therefore, the requestor is entitled to receive copies of these portions of the video recordings pursuant to article 2.1396. Although you assert section 552.108 of the Government Code to withhold this information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act’s general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because

section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under article 2.1396 prevails and the department may not withhold the portions of video recordings at issue under section 552.108. Accordingly, the department must release those portions of the video recordings that depict the stop, the arrest, the conduct of the requestor, or a procedure in which a specimen of the requestor's blood or breath is taken pursuant to article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Next, we note the submitted documents include the breath test results of an individual's blood alcohol content. Section 724.018 of the Transportation Code provides that "[o]n request of the person who has given a specimen at the request of a peace officer, full information concerning the analysis of the specimen shall be made available to the person or the person's attorney." Transp. Code § 724.018. Here, the requestor is the individual who submitted the specimen. Although you claim the information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, a specific right of access provision prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* ORD 451 at 4. Therefore, the department must release the requestor's breath test results pursuant to section 724.018 of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the remaining information relates to an ongoing criminal investigation, and release of that information would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of the case. Based upon this representation, we conclude the release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, as the requestor did not properly request the submitted body worn camera recording pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. The department must release those portions of the video recordings that depict the stop, the arrest, the conduct of the requestor, or a procedure in which a specimen of the requestor's blood or breath is taken pursuant to article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The department must release the requestor's breath test results pursuant to section 724.018 of the Transportation Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Emily Kunst
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EK/mo

Ref: ID# 758856

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)